

EXHIBIT C

Metropolitan Transportation Authority

New York City Transit

State of New York

NYCT Fast Forward Town Hall / York College

August 21, 2018

Milton G. Bassin Performing Arts Center at York College

94-45 Guy R Brewer Blvd

Jamaica, NY

Moderator: Andrei Berman, MTA Media Coordinator

Metropolitan Transportation Authority

New York City Transit

State of New York

NYCT Fast Forward Town Hall / York College

August 21, 2018

Dais Appearance

Andrei Berman
MTA Media Coordinator and Moderator

Andy Byford
President, MTA NYCT

Sarah Meyer
MTA NYCT Chief Customer Officer

Sarah Wyss
MTA NYCT Senior Director Bus Service Planning

Alex Elegudin
MTA NYCT Senior Advisor Systemwide Accessibility

Metropolitan Transportation Authority

New York City Transit

State of New York

NYCT Fast Forward Town Hall / York College

August 21, 2018

<i>Name</i>	<i>Affiliation</i>
1. Mr. X	Private Citizen
2. Russell Barri	Private Citizen
3. Larry Penner	Private Citizen
4. Iris Kelly	Private Citizen
5. NYS Senator James Sanders	Elected Official
6. Eugene Falik	Private Citizen
7. Katrina Barnes	Private Citizen
8. Earl Roberts	Private Citizen
9. Kevin Sealy	Private Citizen
10. Akshar Patel	Representative for NYC Council Member Daneek Miller
11. NYC Council Member Donovan Richards	Elected Official
12. Shain Anderson	Private Citizen
13. David Paul Gerber	Private Citizen
14. Robert and Michael Acevedo	Private Citizens
15. Jason Pinero	Private Citizen
16. Chris Greif	Private Citizen
17. Mildred Moton	Private Citizen

18.	Philip Roncoroni	Private Citizen
19.	Steven Bauman	Private Citizen
20.	Bilal Karriem	Private Citizen
21.	Juan Castillo	Private Citizen
22.	Omar Vera	Private Citizen
23.	David Roth	Private Citizen
24.	George Kaufer	Private Citizen
25.	Richardo Beaussejour	Private Citizen
26.	Mark Henry	Private Citizen
27.	Manuel Martinez	Private Citizen
28.	Annette Harris	Private Citizen
29.	Yerushalam Wu	Private Citizen
30.	Allan Smith	Private Citizen
31.	David Joel	Private Citizen
32.	Norine Wright	Private Citizen
33.	Lauretta Humphrey	Private Citizen
34.	William Kregler	Private Citizen
35.	David Kupferberg	Private Citizen
36.	Alain Berrouet	Private Citizen
37.	AJ Lahiri	Private Citizen
38.	Cynthia Dolphin	Private Citizen
39.	Felicia Johnson	Representative for Community Board number 14
40.	Khaleel Anderson	Representative for Community Board number 14

[Hearing Convened, August 21, 2018 at 5:00:00 PM]

MR. ANDREI BERMAN: I'm excited to be here, helping guide the conversation with New York City Transit president Andy Byford. Just a few housekeeping items before we jump into this evening's program. If you would like to ask a question or raise a concern tonight, please make sure you have registered at the table in the lobby by 8:00 p.m. Exits are located in the back of the auditorium and where indicated and restrooms are located through the lobby. Staff will be on hand to direct. If you have any special needs or concerns, please find an MTA staff member and we will do our best to address them. And please, at this moment, please silent your cell phones.

Also before we begin, I just wanted to quickly acknowledge the elected officials or their representatives in attendance. We have folks here from the mayor's office, comptroller Scott Stringer's office, Senator Leroy Comrie's office, Assembly Member Clyde Vanel, Assembly Member Stacey Pheffer Amato, Council Member Daneek Miller, representative from Community Board 12 and I also understand that a former council member Archie Spigner is in the building, so thank you, highly respected.

Okay. At this time, it's my great honor to introduce Andy Byford, the president of New York City Transit. Andy took the

leadership reins at Transit this past January. He previously led the Toronto Transit Commission and served as the chief operating officer of RailCorp in Sydney, Australia, a career transit professional Andy also held several high ranking positions at the London Underground over the course of nearly two decades of distinguished service in his native Britain.

Upon arriving at New York City Transit, President Byford immediately started tirelessly working to craft the Fast Forward plan that he will present to you in a moment, the plan to transform and modernize our system has been well received thus far, since it was presented in late May, but tonight begins the hard and important work of really explaining the details to the entire city and making the case for its importance. And Andy, that's where you come in. Take it away without further ado, Andy Byford.

MR. ANDY BYFORD: Okay. Good evening, everyone. How are you? So first of all, thank you Andrei, thank you for that kind introduction. I'd like to introduce the panel to you and I will start from the left. So on your right is Sarah Wyss. Sarah is the deputy operations planning chief for buses. That's Sarah. Welcome, Sarah.

To her left, sorry, to her right, in the middle, is Sarah Meyer. Sarah's job is new to transit. She's both new to transit,

but also a new role. It's one that we've created deliberately. It is a statement of intent about how things will be going forward. She is the customer advocate and chief customer officer, Sarah Meyer.

And then, finally, on Sarah's right, your left, you know what I mean, is our accessibility advocate, Alex Elegudin comes to transit. Alex comes to transit from a distinguished career in advocating for the accessibility community. Alex was formerly with the TLC, where he did a fabulous job. But just as we created a new job of chief customer officer, which Sarah filled, I wanted to show that we mean business, we created a job of accessibility advisor, in other words, the accessibility advocate. That was a job that we created deliberately. It reports to me. Alex is on my executive because we are deadly serious about making this system as accessible as it can be as quickly as we can. Welcome, Alex.

Okay. So let's get started, and I've come to the wrong stage, so that's a good start. This is the first of these sessions, so you've got to bear with me while I just get my bearings. Okay. So as Andrei said, Fast Forward plan, this is what it's all about. In case you didn't think it exists, this is it. This is one of the bound copies of the Fast Forward plan and tonight is the first of what I think will be a very long series

of town halls and other consultative fora where we are, and my intention is to build a compelling, an unstoppable, an irresistible coalition of politicians, of media, of New Yorkers and of advocacy groups to make this plan a reality. So this is the very first. Here we are in Queens. We're making history. Queens is where this plan really, I believe, I hope will begin to gain traction, because that's what's needed.

Okay. Sorry, just getting used to this. So, why are we talking about a Fast Forward plan? Well, the harsh reality, the stark reality is that this great system in this great city somehow finds itself in a state of emergency. And that is not a phrase that I made up, it's a phrase that the governor used, the governor of New York State, Andrew Cuomo, rightly put the MTA into a state of emergency following a spate of very high profile disruptive events through what was a very difficult summer of 2017.

And I was actually at a forum in New York, as I was an invited guest from the Toronto Transit Commission, I was at the session where he announced that. And it was shocking to me to see that this great system in this fabulous world city, had somehow, been had to be put into a state of emergency. And I think many New Yorkers, maybe even yourselves, probably were asking yourselves how did it come to this? This is a system that

is carrying more people than it was ever designed for on ever aging infrastructure, on limited funding. So to me, it's a trifecta, it's a triple whammy of influences converting together to create a crisis. So the service was becoming increasingly unreliable, people were leaving the bus network in droves, there were complaints, rightly so, about the fact that the system wasn't accessible and there was general dissatisfaction with the transit service for myriad reasons that culminated in that declaration of a state of emergency.

So I was in Toronto at the time, I like a challenge. And when this job came up, I jumped at it. I wanted to be part of the team that turned around transit. But what I knew was this would be without question, the toughest job in world transit and the hardest task and the hardest challenge of my professional career.

So what is the Fast Forward plan? The Fast Forward plan is a comprehensive, holistic, total modernization, all out modernization of every aspect of New York City transit's operations. It is designed to turn around transit in this city quickly and safely. But it won't be cheap and it won't be easy. And I'll come back to that theme later on. And this plan was put together, this document was consulted widely and it was put together and researched in less than 100 working days of my

arrival on January 21st. And it was build around what I said on the day I arrived at Bowling Green, namely that to me, there's lots of things that need to happen in this city for its transit system. But you can pretty much distill them down into four things.

We need to transform the subway, we need to modernize the bus network to get people back riding the buses again, we need to push on to make this system as accessible as it can be and we need to transform our culture such that it's customer led, that customers feel valued and that we can only do that through embracing and harnessing the passion and the professionalism of the wonderful 50,000 men and women that work at New York City Transit. So in less than 100 days, this plan was consulted and was launched.

And this is no mere tweak. This is not just tweaking what we currently do. This is not just making a few little changes here and there. That would suffice probably, if you wanted to maintain the status quo, if the limit of our ambitions was just to make the existing system work a bit more reliably, then yeah, you could put a little bit of money in, you could make a few changes and we could just about keep struggling by.

But to me, coming into this job, there's no way that we should limit our ambitions to just struggling by. This is the

world's greatest city and it demands and it deserves world class transit. So this is a comprehensive modernization from top to bottom. We will, and we have already, redesigned New York City Transit to be built around a customer centric continuous improvement model. It sounds sort of consultancy, but it's basically making sure that everything we do is done with you in mind, that we are truly customer led, which is why you've seen a lot of me out and about recently, because I do believe name badge on, that you should be accountable to the people that pay your wages.

It's also why we've appointed a chief customer officer. Sarah keeps me on my toes and makes sure I'm thinking of what you want when we make business decisions. So we've remodeled how we do things at the executive level, we're gearing up to deliver what will be the biggest infrastructure investment at probably at any ground field transit ever undertaken, ever attempted anywhere in the world.

There is a role model and to me, that is London, where I used to work, where 20 years ago, the Tube, the London Underground, was in a similar, not as bad, but a similar sort of state in terms of old stations, unreliable signaling systems and increasing unreliability. But to me, that was nowhere near what we face here in New York. But the fact that after sustained

investment, 20 years of sustained investment, London has completely transformed shows that we can do it and we must.

It's more than that, though. It's not just buying new things, it's not just building new stations or putting in elevators or renovating bus depots. It's got to be also overhauling our processes so that they are customer led and shifting the organizational culture so that all 50,000 of us pull together in a common objective, and that's why we needed a vision and that's why we needed a plan.

So what are we going to do in the first five years? I said this is an unprecedented, unheard of rate of investment. I've had colleagues from around the world say are you sure you want to sign up to that, are you sure it can be done? My answer to that is it must be done. We don't have a choice. But in the first five years, here are the headlines. This is the kind of thing that we're going to deliver. State of the art signaling, to once and for all move us away from old, safe but antiquated 1930s in some cases, 1930s signaling that is increasingly unreliable and that limits the amounts of trains that we can run. Completely overhaul the subway cars. I came here on the J line today. I came here on an R-42, one of our oldest trains. And progressively, those things need to go in the museum or on the scrap heap. We should be pushing on, pushing on with

replacing them with state of the art trains, which is actually what we are doing on the J line with the R-179s. More than 50 more accessible stations will be installed in just the first five years, 50 more stations. And you know what that gives us? Within five years, you can be no more than two stops away from an accessible station. So you might have a gap of four between two stations, but if you think about it, you only need to go forward, or backtrack two stations and you will be within, you'll be at an accessible station. That is unheard of. That is a massive leap forward. We're going to push on and renovate, properly renovate, top to bottom, modernize 150 stations in five years. Equip cars to accommodate the new signaling system, redesign all the bus routes, a very topical issue, given that we've just done the redesign of Staten Island Express in the last weekend. But all five boroughs will be done within three years. We will introduce a new fare payment system. No more MetroCard, no more having to line up to renew a MetroCard on a Monday morning. A state of the art fare payment system where you will be able to use your phone, your credit card, and because you can tap on a reader, you'll be able to board at the back door with appropriate revenue protection. And a whole fleet of new buses, 28 new buses, part of a move towards an all electric fleet to cut our carbon footprint.

And that's not all. That's just the first five years. The second five years, another six lines converted to CBCT, communications based train control, another 130 stations made accessible. So that's, if you add through the math, that's 180 over ten years added to the 118 we already have. We will be within striking distance of having a fully accessible system. That is practically unheard of rate of escalation. Another 150 stations for a total of 300, another 3,000 subway cars and another 2,100 new buses.

So people have asked me how do you deliver that CBCT uplift? How on earth can you do that? Well, again, my answer is we've got to do that. Someone did the math not so long ago and said that if the MTA continues at the current rate of CBCT conversion, which is roughly one line at a time and each project takes seven years, it's going to take you 40 to 50 years to get this system resignaled. We simply cannot wait that long. But what it needed, and this is what we were doing in that run up to issuing the plan was a completely new way, a fresh way of how we go about resignaling this railway, this subway. So what we've looked at, in addition in doing the lines in order of age, which is kind of logical, but we should also look at those that have the greatest need in terms of capacity. So a good example would be the Lexington line, which would, if you just did it in order

of age, would be quite far down the list, because it has 1960s signaling, which, you know, in most railways would be pretty old. But it's comparatively new here. But that is a very capacity constrained set of lines. So that needs to be moved up the pecking order.

We're also, I'm calling for, and I know it won't be popular and we can debate this in the question session, we must bite the bullet and there must be selective closures on weekends and extensive use of nights and potentially extended weekends in order to get this done. We would avoid full line closures, and obviously we'd avoid major events that took place in the city. But we've got to bite the bullet and there's no quick or easy way of doing this. So we'll also do more than one line at one.

And by doing that, you get to this scenario, which if you look at what we currently have, these are the lines currently on modern signaling. You're aware of the L line, the famous L line, the line that unfortunately we have to repair the tunnel under the East River. That line currently has, by far, the most reliable service, by far, the highest punctuality and on time running. And that's not by accident. That's because it's inherently more reliable. We can also run the trains safely closer together. So the L line already has modern signaling and we see the benefits. When that works, that work to complete the

tunnel is over, one upside is we're going to build more power stations, more substations, so ultimately when the line reopens, when the affected part of the line reopens, the tunnel in the East River on the Manhattan side, we will actually run more trains.

You guys are very familiar with the trials and tribulations of the 7 line. That is the second line that has been undergoing CBCT conversion. It hasn't been easy. It would be dishonest of me not to say it hasn't had its problems. It has, but we're finally on the glide path to giving you modern signaling, much more reliable service the fall of this year, where there's only a few more, what I call cutovers to do. I promise you that, right, we owe you that. It has been painful getting this process across the line, but we're on the -- working with the supplier practically every day, I speak to their CEO. I have him on speed dial. And I finally see the end in sight. We have a few more closures to go and then you're going to get modern signaling.

But look at the stat. Right now, that's only 900,000 riders a day out of 5.7 million. Within five years, three million riders a day can be on modern signaling and you can see now that the map is beginning to spread, including where we are today. So Jamaica 179th Street and Jamaica Center Parsons Archer to 50th Street, serving the E, the F, the M, and the R line. And then

you can see the other lines up there progressively. Lines in Queens and lines that you guys use when you go to Manhattan will be migrated to this modern signaling. That's just within five years.

Within the following five years, we can increase that to five million riders a day on CBCT. And that is again, unprecedented that we will do 11 lines in ten years. My peers around the world tell me I'm crazy, but we're going to do it. So you might ask what happens to the remainder of the lines. Those will be addressed. We will address them immediately after this first ten years. But we applied some science behind this, we can't do them all at once, and so we have looked at what is the state of good repair of the lines and how busy are they. We will not forget the others. They will done in due course.

So, what does the plan entail apart from just signaling? Well, lots actually. Transforming the subway, that's, it's not about waiting five years. It's not even about waiting ten years. It's about getting on with the improvements right now. So I've already got and I've made a public declaration which I expect to be held accountable for. I have said that by the end of this year, we will take 10,000 delays a month off the total. Currently, there's around 70,000 delays a month. So I've set my team a target of cutting that by 10,000 delays a month.

How are we going to that? An all out, absolute assault on what I call operational basics, trains leaving the depots on time, minimizing the run times, so maximizing the run times in line with what the signaling system can support and minimizing dwell times in platforms, and getting the basics right, where police have to go on the track, making sure those incidents are properly managed and cleared and safely cleared within the minimum amount of time. Deploying more emergency management teams, so if someone gets ill on the train, we get them off more quickly and we make sure that they're looked after and we get the service moved again.

So we're looking at the root causes of every single delay and I'm aiming to deliver, with my team, we're aiming to deliver 10,000 less delays so that you notice tangible improvement by the year end. That's driven by better root cause analysis, and we've already made steps via the Subway Action Plan to do more work overnight. I know it's disruptive, particularly if you're a night worker, but the sad fact is, or the stark fact is there's less people traveling at that time. And critically, we will get the Subway Action Plan completed.

So what have we done so far? We haven't been hanging around. I said to you, it's only May 23rd that we launched the Fast Forward plan. Already, there's a list of what we've done.

Group station managers are, as their names suggests, groups of managers that will run a group of stations. So these will be accountable people who you will get to know because you will see them on and about your groups of stations, who will be accountable ultimately to me, to drive up the level of cleanliness, staff performance, safety, and the general ambience of the stations that you use. They will be in place by the end of September and they will have teams of people working for them and with them and you will see a demonstrable increase in the level of cleanliness at stations, and local accountability, as local managers get deployed to fix local issues quickly.

Other things that we've done, sorry, other things we've done. We've been installing new equipment. To make this Queens specific, we put in a new switch in near Queensboro Plaza. Why did we do that? Because the other one, the one that was already there was unreliable. We've been replacing track, we've increased weekday services on services that serve Queens, the E and the F. We've completed extensive renovations at a number of your stations, and as part of our customer charter, we're improving bathroom facilities.

Next of the four items, reimagining the bus network, I have talked about this already, so I'll keep this item short. Effectively, every one of the bus routes will be completely re-

imagined. That means looking at why it is that people have stopped using that bus service, what they like about it, what they don't like about it will be fed into a comprehensive review. And this means taking decisive action. I want to see more bus lanes, I want to see those bus lanes that are there properly policed, and stopping the selfish parking that's blocking buses from getting through the network. We will speed up boarding by the implementation of the smart card that I talked about earlier, and we will continue to push on via our modernized bus fleet with more reliable bus service.

So again, we haven't been wasting time. This is what we've been up to. We've already installed what's called traffic signal priority on the traffic lights of the Q-43, a Queens bus service. And what that basically means is there's a device that you can use that works between the bus and the traffic light to either maintain the green for longer to give the bus priority or to shorten the cycle and turn a red to green. We've addressed bottlenecks, we've installed buses on the Q-50, so one of your bus routes, we've piloted a double-decker bus on Staten Island, useful for some routes, not really suitable for others. We've increased services on those routes, you can see the Q-6, 8, 29, 47, 65, 69 and 101, and we are coordinating with PD for this all out blitz that we're calling for to get the bus lanes clear.

Under Alex' leadership, we have said, I told you earlier that we will have within five years, a situation where you're no more than two stops away from an accessible subway station. But again, it's not about waiting 'til then. We're taking action now to make Access-A-Ride more attractive, so you don't go all round the boroughs while you're trying to get from A to B. We're simplifying our procedures to make them fairer, we've launched a new app, an AAR app, and we're also insisting that all 50,000 employees of Transit, regardless of the job you do, including, you know, if you're the president, if you're a planner, if you're a COMS director, everyone will go through sensitivity training, because we want everyone to treat people with mobility impairment with respect.

So what have we done? We've hired Alex, we're already surveying the stations, we're surveying all of the remaining stations to see how quick and easy it will be or what the complexities are and what the costs will be of all the remaining station. And we'll then put them into an order, working with the accessibility advocates to see which ones we're going to do next. But again, not waiting, we're not waiting for the future. The elevators, the existing fleet, are not as reliable as they should be, so we're taking action to make them more reliable. They're not as clean as they should be, so we're making changes

to our cleaning rosters so that the elevators are clean and they're available. Changing signage to make sure that people know where to go and also changing our procedures, so that if you do find that there's an elevator out of action, you will already have been told about it via a new app.

The fourth area is to engage and empower our employees. One of the most gratifying things I've found since I came to New York, in spite of relentless criticism, because there is relentless criticism, a lot of it justified, but it's a hard gig working in the public sector. And yet the 50,00 men and women of Transit I think do a stellar job day in and day out under quite trying circumstances. They are remarkably upbeat for the job that they do, they are remarkably professional, given the equipment that they use. And I salute my 50,000 colleagues, which is why I said on day one, people expected me to talk about the subway, they expected me to talk about buses, maybe accessibility. They weren't expecting this bit. We intend to undertake a raft of activities to truly inspire and motivate and lead our employees, our colleagues, in a modern and enlightened way, so that they feel inspired to manage you and give you world class customer service.

So lots of activity happening there, including, on the next -- there's a page coming up -- the recruitment of a chief people

officer who is effectively the third person in conjunction with the customer advocate, accessibility advocate, we will also have an employee advocate.

The final few slides, there's been a lot of criticism of the MTA over recent years for the alleged lack of transparency in some cases, for the fact that we have lots of projects that never seem to finish on time or on budget. So we're taking huge efforts, both with transit and the other agencies to streamline our procurement to make it easier for us to deal with, to drive up competition, to make our processes more efficient and to make sure that the norm going forward is to deliver on time and on budget. And accountability is important to us, so we have launched a whole raft of dashboards so you can see how we're performing.

Another theme that runs through this plan is of course safety and security. It's job one. We've got to keep you safe and secure. So we're doing a lot of work with the PD already. They've launch neighborhood police offices, police who are dedicated to particular stations. They will be paired up with those group station managers that I talked about earlier. And we're also making it easier for our employees to report any safety concerns, particularly if they feel that they can't raise a concern, they will now be able to do so anonymously so that we

can act upon it is that they want to tell us.

We never let up in the guard against terrorism, we never let up also in the guard against climate change. So we're doing a lot of work to increase our resiliency, both against terrorist threats and against flooding.

And then the third theme that runs through this plan is customer service and communication as represented by Sarah. So we have launched a customer commitment, which I have here somewhere, which is for the -- this is new to Transit, this document, which is online. This document sets out very short term initiatives that we will deliver on a quarterly basis. So it does require confidence on our part and it requires absolute transparency. You can hold us to account. So this document sets out specific things that we're going to do in 12 week periods. And at the end of that 12 weeks, we will report at the board, in public, did we meet those targets, yes or no. It's kind of binary. There's no halfway house.

So it does include things, specifics, such as renovating stations and repairing washrooms, restrooms, so that they're available for you to use again. So I do commend you to look at that. And then a whole raft of other activities to truly make you feel valued while you're with us.

So again, what have we done so far? We've launched that

customer commitment. We've found that there are stations out there that do not have public address, the means by which our control center can sent you information. That's ridiculous in 2018, so we're fixing it. There's around 70 stations I believe. We can't do them all at once, so as part of this commitment, we're currently installing public address at 13 of those stations. We will push on and finish off the rest of them.

And we're also making it easier for people to interact with us in our customer service center. So the reclaim, the claim processing times, for example, if you have a problem with your MetroCard have been slashed by 70 percents and that's in seven months of us together as a new team.

Final two slides, what's next, what's coming up? I've already promised you we're going to get that CBTC done for Queens. We're going to have it done on the 7 line. And we have, the next charge of CBTC actually affects Queens, on the Queens Boulevard, on the E line, that is next up, it's already let, the contract is let, we're already starting the work. We have various station renovations going on. You can see them on the map there, you can see on the chart rather where we're doing both station repairs and also full renovations, actually rebuilding platforms in some cases.

We're installing ADA elevators at Astoria Boulevard on the

N and W, at Court Square on the G, and Wood Haven Boulevard on the J and Z, and working down on the Rockaways to better protect against flood surges in that vulnerable section going across the marsh. Repairing the elevated structure from 48 to 104th Street, I just came through there just the other day and reconstructing to make a bus depot so that our operators there have modern fit for purpose facilities from which to operate.

So that's it. There's a lot to get through there, and I appreciate your patience while you listened to it, but it's important that you understand and you know just how wide ranging this plan is, and let me just make some, a couple of key final points. I alluded to this earlier. Delivering a plan that that's comprehensive in ten years with be neither quick, nor easy, nor cheap. But the alternative, which some people advocate, which is to do nothing, which is what's been happening for the last 20, 25, 30 years, which is why we're in this state of emergency we currently find ourselves. The alternative is a slow decline into further unreliability. And I don't think anyone sitting in here in this room wants that.

I would also argue that actually the need doesn't go away. It just gets more expensive and it gets more difficult as the infrastructure ages and the population grows. So we must bite the bullet. And for this plan to succeed, we need billions of

dollars, roughly a doubling of what we currently receive at Transit on the five basis, we need political support that will prolong beyond the political cycle, in other words, visionaries who will sign up to something that probably will not be delivered until they have moved on to do something else. And ultimately, we need your patience. We need your patience to bear with us while we undertake the difficult work, station closures, line closures on weekends, installing elevators. It's not easy and it will mean inconvenience, but the gain will be worth the pain.

If we don't do it, we will see further slow decline. If we do do it, within less than 4,000 days, ten years, less than 4,00 days, we can give you a world class transit system for the world's greatest city. Thank you. [applause]

MR. BERMAN: Thank you, Andy. So I just want to explain how the Q&A is going to run tonight. If you would like to ask a question this evening, and you haven't done so already, please register at the registration table in the lobby. Once you register, you'll be given a register, you'll be given a yellow speaker tab that looks like this. Many of you probably already have received it. You'll submit that to the usher, the relevant ushers. Ushers, raise your hands, when your name is called. And we ask that when your name is called, you walk over to the

nearest mic. We'll also have staff who can assist with hand held mics for those who may need assistance. There are a decent number of people here tonight, which is terrific, but in order to ensure that we're able to hear from as many people as possible, we will be limiting everyone to 90 seconds to ask their question and part of my role is to enforce that 90 second limit. And there is a timer in the front of the stage for your reference. It will blink yellow after 60 seconds, and then that's your 30 second warning. Out of courtesy for your fellow community members, we ask that you respect the 90 second limit. Registration will remain open until about 8:00 o'clock and if you didn't get a chance to pose a question or have it answered because of the number of folks here, you can leave your questions in writing on the question and comment cards available at the registration table and someone will get back to you.

In addition to questions that are asked at the mic tonight, there will be continued opportunity throughout the program for you to ask MTA staff who are located in the lobby any additional or super specific questions. And with that, let's get to the questions. So the first two folks to come up are Mr. X and Rusell Barri. Mr. X, whenever you are ready.

MR. X: I have a question for Ronnie Hakim who looks like Juan Epstein from Welcome Back Kotter. Does she think it's

possible if she can advertise these events on the website in a timely manner? This event was advertised on the website after last Tuesday, which is why you have empty seats. If this forum was so important to you, why didn't you advertise it, why didn't you advertise it in a timely manner. Then you add your 96 public hearing, which was first advertise last Monday as far as I know, 3.50 weeks before event day. Why not advertise them, the public hearings four weeks or more before event day, not under four weeks or under three for that matter. And again, Juan Epstein from Welcome Back Kotter decided to no-show. This is what she did on 9/12 in Manhattan, primary election day, held a public hearing, it started at 4:30 and then no-showed. And I asked her if she's stuck on stupid, and again I'm asking, is she stuck on stupid? You know, she advertised these public hearings in an untimely manner, starts them before 6:00 p.m., although she started this one before 6:30 and then no-shows. Is there any particular reason why she can't show at these events? After all, she's running the MTA, which stands for money thrown away.

MR. BERMAN: Ten seconds.

MR. X: There's no reason why she can't show. If I can show, she can show. What's her, what's her excuse? And also, one more question, Roosevelt Island Station, do you intend to --

MR. BERMAN: Time.

MR. X: -- open upper, upper level --

MR. BERMAN: Thank you, Mr. X.

MR. X: -- which was partially built but never opened?

That's what I would like to know.

MR. RUSSELL BARRI: I'll be a little lighter than that. But thank you for having this town hall meeting. I just wanted to ask when you guys do get this plan going, how do you guys receive the funds? Does it come from the state or does it come from taxpayers, or how do you guys take care of the funds that take care of the tracks and the buses and all that?

MR. BERMAN: Andy?

MR. BYFORD: Sorry, I thought we were going to take more questions at once. So let me deal with those first two first of all? Do we have a hand mic that we can share? But let me deal with those first two. So the first up, Mr. X, look, I'll take the hit on that. It's actually nothing to do with Ronnie Hakim. This is a NTCT event, and alright, it's part of the MTA, but this is Transit's event, and I'm accountable, because I'm the president of Transit. So, we did, it was a bit short notice, so what we've said to the community, and particularly to the elected officials to whom also they received rather short notice, we're actually going to have a second event in Queens. Typically, it will be probably one event per borough. But we've

already committed, I promised yesterday that we'd have another event in Queens. So anyone who didn't hear about it or had a conflict, don't worry, we're going to run another one. And I think Mr. X is right, we should be aiming for four weeks. So I'll take that on the chin.

Roosevelt Island, I'm not aware of any plans to do that. There's a lot to do in this plan. I mean obviously there's a limit to what we can do. We can't do everything, but I am aware of people's desires to see something done about that, so I would have to check on the status of it.

And to your question, sir, about funding, I mean you said will it be from the state or from taxpayers. Well, ultimately the state's money comes from taxpayers. And so it will be a mixture, I believe, of different funding sources. What I do know, and ultimately I leave the funding debate to the politicians because they're the ones that can generate the money. I can't. I know two things. One, my job is to present and prepare a compelling vision. So that's what we've done. What we've said is, hey, New Yorkers, hey politicians, this is what could be done within ten years. My job is to provide that as a vision. What I'm now saying is we really need you to fund this.

And so to some extent, I'm agnostic as to where the funding comes from. I think it will though come from a mixture of

sources, federal money, state money, city funding. It certainly can't be funded through the fare box, absolutely not. Fare box covers operational funding. This is extensive, billion dollar capital funding and it will require a big debate. That's why we kicked it off tonight.

MR. BARRI: The reason why --

MR. BERMAN: I think that's the question so we're going to go to the next person.

MR. BARRI: I have to say one more thing. That's the main reason I'm up here.

MR. BERMAN: Twenty seconds.

MR. BARRI: I came here to hand this to you and your team because my boss and I want to meet with you in person. We have a \$3.5 billion fund. It's for leasing equipment, buses, for new trains, for new tracks, for new equipment to fix the tracks or fix the buses. So we just want to be able to bring this to. You're a very hard man to get a hold of. We try to call your office, we try to do e-mails. Couldn't find it, couldn't make that happen. That's why I'm here today. That's why I'm trying to give you another option to make --

MR. BYFORD: So, obviously within the realms of, or within the constraints procurement works, we'll gladly take the document from you.

MR. BARRI: Sure.

MR. BYFORD: And we'll be happy to have a look at it.

MR. BARRI: That's all I ask.

MR. BERMAN: Okay, next two speakers, if they could approach the mics, Iris Kelly and Larry Penner, whomever gets there first.

MR. PENNER: Good evening. My name is Larry Penner, I'm a transportation advocate, historian and writer. In the interest of transparency, I worked for the Federal Transit Administration, retired several years ago, had the privilege of working with many of your predecessors on your multi-capital, billion dollar capital program. What's missing here, there's no evidence of preliminary or final design engineering or value engineering to validate the project cost estimates, nor do we have the annual track average plan or force account plan to integrate your tremendous amount of work on top of the existing work that will be funded in the next five year capital plan. We have no idea how much of your proposal duplicates what's going on behind the scenes in the next 2020-24 five year capital plan versus this plan.

At the end of the day, it will be a miracle for the MTA to fund 32 billion for the next five year capital plan, let alone your 38 billion. I have one interesting solution for you, and

that's my question. There's 1.7 billion programmed in the current five year capital plan for Second Avenue subway. The next five year capital plan, you're looking for 2.3 billion, for a total of \$4 billion for Second Avenue subway for a simple two station extension from 96th Street to 101 Street. For a total of \$4 billion, you would use that to leverage --

MR. BERMAN: Twenty seconds.

MR. PENNER: -- two billion in Federal Transit Administration new starts projects. I would argue that you would get a better bang for the buck, because \$4 billion for improvements into the subway system across the board, rather than Second Avenue subway. So if Diogenes is looking for an honest soul on this table, on this panel, including yourself, will you be brave enough, since we're in a crisis situation to say no, Second Avenue Subway, we have to hold up --

MR. BERMAN: Wrap it up, thanks.

MR. PENNER: -- because we have to pay for ten percent of what you're looking for.

MR. BYFORD: Are we doing two at once?

MR. BERMAN: Yeah. You want to do two at once?

MR. BYFORD: I'll answer this one. I thought we were again, we were going to do two. So well first off, I'm not going to make, design the system from a microphone. That Second Avenue

subway, I note your comments, sir, and I respect your opinion. But there are valid reasons for progressing the Second Avenue Subway. But what I'm talking about here, this plan does require billions, you're absolutely right. I hope in my presentation, I conveyed the urgency of what faces us, namely that to not bite the bullet and to not do this comprehensive multi-modal infrastructure renewal, we will regret it in years to come.

So there is design assumption behind the figures. We don't just pluck the figures out of thin air. It will be, the plan was put together in 100 days. The reason we haven't actually declared the official figure is because we are still dotting the i's and crossing the t's and making sure that we have worked through the granular detail of what the critical path looks like and what the various constituent parts of the funding look like, so that we can make a compelling case to the Senate and to the FTA, and to whomever else wants to listen, a compelling case that is backed up by data and by logical analysis.

MR. PENNER: On paper, that sounds great, but I've seen this before with all your predecessors.

MR. BERMAN: It's not a response.

MR. PENNER: Plans have come and gone, in all honesty. And unless you convince Governor Cuomo, and Mayor de Blasio to come up with \$2 billion dollars --

MR. BERMAN: Larry, I appreciate it, we've got to get to the next speaker.

MR. PENNER: -- you know, hard cash, it's a dream, it's not going to happen. I wish you luck.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you.

MR. BERMAN: Iris.

MS. IRIS KELLY: Yes.

MR. BYFORD: Forgive me by the way for drinking coffee, I have a terrible headache.

MS. KELLY: My question about the R service. It's been not good. Are you going to do an overnight service, coming from [unintelligible] [00:44:34] just going to Bay Bridge is terrible service in terms of getting the R train. And the other thing is about in Brooklyn also, the elevators. They said over at NYU, no one used in a long while, in this past year, so they said they're going to be elevators in 77th Street and also 95th Street and Bay Ridge, Brooklyn. And I was wondering when it's going to be, if like possibly sooner, because we need for people with [unintelligible] [00:44:55] if you want to be able to get in the subway, to be accessible.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. I'll ask Alex to comment on the detail around the elevator. The R service, and we are reviewing the performance of every single subway line at the moment, and

rather than just have that as an aspiration, our methodology is much more data driven than it previously was. In other words, we're using data to get to the bottom of what are the root causes of delay. You can, there's no point in just hoping a line will get better. You've got to look at what are the specific things that are driving unreliability on a particular line. You know, is it the signaling system, is it a particular switch, is it a problem with the track, is it problems with the timetable, is it issues with people on the track? There's myriad reasons that can impact a particular line and progressively, on a line by line basis, we are tackling those root causes and that's what will deliver the 10,000 delay reduction by the end of the year.

That, plus substantial investment in new, more reliable rolling stock and substantial investment in a new, more reliable signaling system, so just bear with us, I'm not happy either with the R line but it's one of many things that my senior vice president of the subway, a new person, a new appointee is now looking at as a matter of urgency with her team. Alex, I'll just ask you to talk about how we're going to prioritize the rollout of elevators.

MR. ALEX ELEGUDIN: Sure. On the two specific elevators that you mentioned in Bay Ridge, I will definitely go back and check. I know they've been on the list. I know there have been

some challenges in getting those off the ground, but I do know it's incredibly important because that stretch of the R line from 95th Street pretty much to 36th Street doesn't have any accessible stations. And we know that it's a priority to heavily used portion, and ultimately represents a big gap in service for accessible users. In the next five year capital plan, stations along the R line there and many stations in South Brooklyn will certainly be on the list because we are committed to making sure that we are no more than two stations away.

And you should all look out for some community engagements we're going to be doing as we go towards the end of this year to get feedback from the community as to what the next 50 elevators, 50 accessible stations should be. We're working internally on that through the studies that we're conducting on feasibility, what are the costs, what are the engineering capabilities. We will bring to the public and hopefully have an engaged conversation on the next 50 stations. Again, there are many more to go, but we hope to get a close consensus as to what that should look like and thank you for that question and I will definitely look into those two specific ones.

MR. BERMAN: Thank you, Alex. I understand that Senator James Sanders is here and would like to speak, so if you could just come up to the mic and then after that, Eugene Falik is

next, but let's let Senator Sanders speak. Thank you.

SENATOR JAMES SANDERS: Good morning to you both.

MR. BERMAN: Good evening.

SENATOR SANDERS: It's morning somewhere, and I'm sure it must feel like you've been here all night. Good evening to the board, good evening, Mr. President, it's quite different from London, huh?

MR. BYFORD: It has one or two differences.

SENATOR SANDERS: I'm glad that there's going to be another meeting in Queens, so I won't go into that. I'm glad that we're going to do another one and that will give me a time to study your plan even more. Just two observations and then I will respect the audience and let other people speak. I am blessed to have the Rockaways and of course, that put me on the A train. I've rode it most of my life. I know it well. Some may argue too well. I do know that around 65 percent of the people heading south, 65 percent of the people on the A train are heading to the Rockaways, yet most of the trains are going to Lefferts Boulevard. It has always befuddled me to know why is this. I'm talking three to one in terms of trains coming. I've actually raised the question to the MTA in days gone by, and they told me that if they would change it, it would mess with the, with the rate of cars going to Lefferts Boulevard. And I said but most of

your people are going towards the Rockaways. Why would the majority of your trains be going to Lefferts Boulevard. I'm very concerned about accessibility. The Rockaways only has one elevator in it totally. And that's at Mott Avenue, and that was a recent configuration. Down on 116th Street, it is an even platform, so it doesn't need an elevator, but seemingly the middle would, the middle of the Rockaways, under those conditions. East 67th Street, the first time the train hits the Rockaways, we absolutely need an elevator there. Many more observations, but I will save them for another day.

My last point. Can I encourage you sir to immediately get the members of the senate, the New York City delegation and/or the ones who have the subway and meet with them by yourself? Yes, it is true, we've got a heck of a fight up north. And it's not one that looks good. However, I've been told that November may make your life a little easier. And under those conditions -

-

MR. BERMAN: Senator, I'm in the unenviable position of asking you to wrap it up, but I appreciate --

SENATOR SANDERS: Okay, not a problem. Sir, it would be, it's a wise move to call us and have us a very frank conversation how we can be useful. I look forward to the rest of this and I'm very glad that my neighbors were able to come out

in short term and meet with you, my new neighbors. Thank you so much. [applause]

MR. BYFORD: Well, Senator, we're honored to have you here, thank you for coming. And you have my earlier commitment and apology for the problems we had, the slight snafu we had with the notice period. We will rectify that. I've committed that we will have a further session. That's interesting you say about trains heading to the Rockaways. I've heard that too. I have, I come into this job, as do my new colleagues, we've come into this job not to give the impression to our existing colleagues that we know better. But we do come in with a fresh perspective, and that's what I promise you that in everything we will at least hear you out.

And I've said to my team I want the default of New York City Transit, I can't speak for the whole MTA, but New York City Transit, I want our default to be yes unless we can't, rather than no unless we can, so a complete reversal. And I also want to demonstrate that we're open for business, so in other words, new ideas. I want us to cut out obvious nonsenses. So that's one of the things that we're looking at. You know, I can't say to you for certain that we're going to change that, but I've heard enough about it and I did take the train up from the Rockaways just the other weekend, that we are actively looking into that.

So my default will be yes, unless we, unless a compelling reason why we can't.

Just a couple of other things, the elevator Alex will look into I'm sure. The meeting with the Senate, I have been to Albany. I've been here seven months. I've been to quite a few town halls, but I did go up to Albany. I did meet with the New York delegation, but they definitely, you, you and your colleagues, absolutely I want to have that meeting. In fact, I think it's being arranged imminently. I mean what I said when I said that this will only succeed if we build an unstoppable, irresistible coalition where everyone is saying can we please just get on with this, that's the task and we need to do it together.

MR. BERMAN: Eugene.

MR. EUGENE FALIK: My name is Gene Falik. I'm glad to, that you heard from a member of my civic association, my state senator. I was disappointed to see that your presentation began with a non-truth. You know of course there is no New York City Transit. You work for the New York City Transit Authority. I'm also disappointed that you brought PR people instead of licensed, professional engineers. I was wondering about a couple of things. Have you considered opening the bathrooms in Rockaway? All the stations were built with bathrooms and were

open when then Long Island Railroad operated those tracks. And they were open initially when the Transit Authority operated the system. I was wondering though if you could discuss Queens Rail? It seems to me that it's the most sensible option for providing service to the airport --

MR. BERMAN: Thirty seconds.

MR. FALIK: -- for providing improved service to the raceway, to letting people from Rockaway get to the Queens Center Malls and providing a 50 minute trip from Rockaway to Midtown. It seems me that it's a very simple thing to do. You can repair three and a half miles of track to White Pot Junction, run the trains over the Long Island Railroad tracks to the 63rd Street Tunnel.

MR. BERMAN: If you could start wrapping it up, that'd be great.

MR. FALIK: Excuse me?

MR. BERMAN: If you could just begin to finish, we only have 90 seconds.

MR. FALIK: I'm finishing. Run them on railroad tracks to the 63rd street tunnel and then back on to Transit Authority tracks. That would not impact the Queens Boulevard line. It would dramatically improve service.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you for the question. The bathrooms, the

restrooms I made reference to in my presentation, which was to say that as part of our recently launched customer commitment, we are looking at renovating restrooms. We are looking were possible to reopen them. And once they're open, to keep them open, make sure that they're serviced, make sure that they're clean. There are reasons why restrooms I'm told were shut back in the day, but my view is that as long as there's no compelling safety reason why we shouldn't open them, to me, it's a customer service basic.

So that's going to take a bit of time, but already, as I mentioned on my presentation, that is listed within the commitment and also, we've already started on some of those overhauls with the professional chief customer officer, not a PR person actually, that I have with me.

You mentioned Queens Rail. We talked about it before outside in the lobby, so I won't repeat what I said.

MR. FALIK: You didn't really answer.

MR. BYFORD: No, what I said and I will answer again is I'm aware of the proposal. Right now, that is no more than a proposal. I'm aware of it. There's a lot to deliver in this plan. So I think it would be disingenuous of me to say that it's in the plan because it isn't. But I am aware of it and I do intend to look into it further.

MR. BERMAN: Thank you. Katrina Barnes and Earl Roberts, if you could approach the mics.

MS. KATRINA BARNES: Good evening, President. There's an ADA compliant issue with the Assess-A-Ride evaluation and intake locations, specifically the one located at 6611 Woodhaven Boulevard and Regal Park, New York. Does the Fast Forward plan include renovations and remodeling of these intake location centers?

MR. BYFORD: Okay. I'll ask Alex to please respond to that. Thank you for the question.

MR. ELEGUDIN: Do you mind just elaborating on the deficiencies?

MS. BARNES: So the entrance to enter the evaluation intake center in Queens, it's not ADA accessible. So I have photos, I can forward you the photos, because I took my grandmother down there to apply for Access-A-Ride. It's very difficult to get inside the actual building. It's not ADA compliant. There's no buttons you can press for the door to actually open automatically, so does the plan include renovating these evaluation intake locations?

MR. ELEGUDIN: I would say that the Fast Forward plans includes many elements of improving Access-A-Ride. That specific point is not in the plan, but ultimately wherever we do

eligibility and assessment, it should be accessible.

MS. BARNES: Absolutely.

MR. ELEGUDIN: I will definitely look into it and find out what the deficiencies are.

MS. BARNES: Okay. Awesome.

MR. ELEGUDIN: And even if it per se meets code, but there's significant difficulty for a customer to really --

MS. BARNES: Major challenges to get into that building, major challenges.

MR. ELEGUDIN: Right. Absolutely. We'll look into that.

MS. BARNES: Okay. Thank you.

MR. BERMAN: Thank you.

MR. EARL ROBERTS: Good evening. My question was basically already answered regarded the elevators. And since you wanted a priority list, can you make right here, Parsons, make that number one on your priority, put an elevator there? And I'm glad to hear that elevators will be no more than two stops away at each station. That's beneficial. Can you improve bus services so that we don't have all these reckless vans that are driving down all these bus routes? Can we get improved bus services immediately?

MR. BYFORD: Okay. So I'll take up the bus service issue, sir and I'll ask Alex to comment on how are we going to do the

priority listing and how are we going to engage the community to do that. The bus services, yeah, we mentioned this. I saw one of those vans outside actually when I came out to the station. In fact, I saw more than one of those vans. And the way, just for everyone else's benefit, when I answered the question earlier, I said it seems to me there's two ways that we need to tackle this.

First up, I think there needs to be more effective policing because a lot of those vans are illegal, they shouldn't be there and so my view would be that that needs to be properly policed up to and including big fines and if necessary, confiscation of vehicles. But also, we need to look at why is it that people are using those vans, which leads me to your second point.

Absolutely, we need to continuously improve bus service. That's why we're undertaking these borough by borough, route by route reviews. So that's to me the double way that you get rid of the vans. You police them so that they know they're not supposed to be there and there's a penalty if they are. But also you cut off the supply because people increasingly flock back to the buses. That's going to take a bit of time but my commitment is Queens will be reviewed in the same way that we're now reviewing the Bronx. We're going to review every single bus route and figure out what is it that is stopping people from using he the bus

system. On accessibility?

MR. ELEGUDIN: So, just to give you a little bit more insight on how we're going to be selecting the next ADA stations. The study that's currently being conducted is looking at over ten different factors. Those factors include cost, technical feasibility, we're looking at intermodal stations, stations where you can connect to bus routes, obviously terminal stations where subway lines end. We're looking at demographic information, where people with disabilities live, we're looking at activity centers, like colleges, potentially medical centers, potentially malls to show where the most useful stations, where the most used stations would be. We 100 percent understand that every station that's a local station needs to be accessible, but in terms of making our priority decisions, those are the things we're looking at.

In terms of the hundred key station plan that's existed from the '80s, that was selected by the stations that are most used. That's why you see them primarily in Manhattan. With this exercise of selecting the next stations, we really are looking to focus on the outer boroughs because as we know, it's a proven fact that people with disabilities live more in the outer boroughs. So obviously, we have to create more density and close out some gaps in the accessible service. And we will be doing

all the selection process in coordination with the community and trying to build a consensus. Ultimately, we know that will be tough because many stations remain. But we'll be engaging and having those difficult conversations. Thank you for that question.

MR. BERMAN: Thank you so much. Next up Kevin Sealy and Akshar Patel.

MR. KEVIN SEALY: Yes, now going back to the early 1980s, there was a plan to run a subway line, running through Richman Hill, all the way through Long Island City. That's the old Montauk branch. It was back in the early 1989s, but that plan was killed. But also that same plan was to extend subway all the way out to Laurelton, Queens. The gentleman that spoke earlier mentioned Queens Way, or the Queens Rail. This is like using the old Long Island Railroad, the Rockaway line, that's still up in the air. But also, Southeast Queens is very much underserved by bus service. At 6:00 o'clock in the morning, you can get on the Q4, it looks more like 6:00 o'clock in the morning during the weekday. My other concern is I have an unlimited MetroCard. I've been having one since 1977. This new system, for us who live in a double fare zone, are we going to lose out with this new system? The unlimited MetroCard allows me to use the MetroCard 100 times or more within a 30 days period.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you. Thanks for the question. Okay, so on the first one, and again, it links back to the gentleman's question around Queens Rail. I need to look into this, because I just don't have the detail on Queens Rail and the other disused line, or the former line that you talked about or the planned line. But what I would say is the Fast Forward plan is largely about making, it's largely about modernizing what we already have, which is in itself a Herculean task. There's a huge amount to do. But I wouldn't rule out using, you know, looking at other corridors, and certainly I'm always interested as a transit professional, I'm always interested if there is a transit corridor that's lying disused, then that's extremely interesting. We're having a look at one on Staten Island at the moment, where we think there's potential for a bus rapid transit route. So definitely, I will look into it, I just don't have that detail. You know, there's only so much that you can focus on at once. And right now, my focus is on rebuilding the existing network. And again, I'll reiterate, that's kind of a Herculean task. On the MetroCard, I'm going to ask Sarah to talk to that point.

MS. SARAH MEYER: Hello. So the new fare payment system does the same thing that the MetroCard does now. But it actually will let us do more. When we do station closures, we're going to

be able to do more three-legged transfers without using those paper tickets that you get from the buses. So the system allows us to be much more responsive and careful with your very valuable funds.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you, Sarah.

MR. BERMAN: Mr. Patel?

MR. AKSHAR PATEL: Good evening, President Byford. I'm representing Council Member I. Daneek Miller. Unfortunately, he wasn't able to attend today, due to being Eid and its holiday, so I just wanted to say, he wanted me to give public remarks, first of all that he wanted to say thank you for returning his phone calls for the last couple of days. He's very appreciative about the response regarding the outreach for this town hall and he wants to thank you allowing him to provide another venue for another upcoming town hall and just wanted to say we have a productive meeting a couple of months and we look forward to continue to work with you. Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Well, I very much appreciate that. Please give him my best regards. We had an excellent conversation which I think bodes well for the future.

MR. BERMAN: Great. I understand that Council Member Donovan Roberts is here and would like to speak. Did I say Roberts? Donovan Richards, my bad and Shain Anderson, you'll be

the next speaker, so if you want to approach the mic as well.

MR. DONOVAN RICHARDS: Well, thank you, I guess, Council Member Roberts is here. It's an honor. First I want to welcome you and thank you, President for holding this town hall in Southeast Queens. Let me start off, I know my colleague, Daneek Miller couldn't be here. I don't know if Adrienne Adams was able to attend. And I'm happy to hear you're going to use and do another town hall, because we found this to be done in a disingenuous manner and in a way that gives the mere appearance that you weren't really interested in true community engagement. So we look forward to having another meeting to ensure that this audience is filled, because there are a lot of Southeast Queens residents and Rockaway residents who certainly have input that I think would be valuable to the MTA.

Let me start off with a few things. One, I'm very happy to hear you're talking of modernizing our bus system. As you know, Queens as a whole has undergone a lot of growth, but Southeast Queens and the Rockaways seems to be undergoing tremendous growth at this moment and it seems as if the bus lines have not been able to keep up with that. I will start because I want to make sure we put the bus lines on the record. The Q5, the 84, the 85, 5, 111, 113, 114, Q77, 22, the Q52, there's probably a snail could get to Parsons and Archer faster than our bus lines

can during this day and age. So I'm really hoping that as you speak of modernizing our bus lines that Southeast Queens and the Rockaways are truly prioritized. It can take us anywhere up to two hours to get into Manhattan and this is why we applaud you for doing the Freedom Ticket Program, which has been a huge success.

However, one of the things we have neglected to do through that program and whether you talk about the Freedom Ticket or City Ticket, we've left the Rockaways totally out of two programs that certainly are located in transit deserts. So we're hoping to hear a lot more about what you're going to do to ensure that true inclusion is happening for the outer borough. We talked about handicapped accessibility. In the Rockaway, at least on the east end, and there are over 70,000 individuals, but yet only one train station is handicap accessible, which means that around 60 to 70 percent of the population has no way of actually getting to the train station.

MR. BERMAN: One more, sir, we've just got a lot of speakers.

MR. RICHARDS: I'm going to wrap up because I'm going to see him next week, but I just wanted to say thank you for coming here. We're going to touch on a lot of this next week, but our community certainly deserves better and we look forward to

hearing the next plan to make sure that this town hall is going to be held in a way that everyone can get to it, and I will also urge you to do one in the Rockaways as well. Thank you.

[applause]

MR. BYFORD: We don't know each other, but I actually don't do disingenuous. That was a genuine error on our part, but I will take accountability for that, so I am genuinely sorry about that. So we will get that right going forward. And you know, I look back on my seven months here, I have lost count of how many public meetings I've attended, town halls, consultative sessions, one-on-ones out on the system, wearing a name badge, talking to customers, that's what I do. So I'm slightly embarrassed by the fact that we inadvertently didn't give you enough notice. That won't happen again.

Just a couple of things. Modernizing the bus system, you've heard me talk about with the subway, it's important that you look at the root cause, that's cause and effect. So it's the same for buses, right. Yeah, the buses in some cases, move quote, at a snail's pace. That's not the buses' fault. What we need to do is get the root cause of why the buses are hopelessly mired and ensnared in traffic. And I would respectfully submit to you that that's where the Senate, but particularly City Council comes in. I've been here long enough, just seven months,

but I've been here long enough to know how hard it is to even initiate a debate about an additional SBS route or to even initiate a debate, not from you sir, but from in some quarters to even raise the suggestion of a bus lane, a dedicated bus lane and the howls of opposition that well up, you know, I cannot over emphasize.

So if we're truly to get our buses working at the speed we want, because it is embarrassing that New York City's bus service is the slowest in North America. Why? It's not because our vehicles have speed limits, it's because they're hopelessly caught in traffic. We need to work together, transit professionals, elected officials and want to do this. The buses can't levitate, they are stuck in traffic. So DOT, I have to say have been fantastic. My friend and colleague, Commissioner Polly Trottenberg, the mayor, I have spoken to on a number of occasions, he's very supportive, so we can do this. And so that's my commitment to you and I really look forward sir, to continuing the discussion next week.

MR. BERMAN: Alright. Shain Anderson and David Paul Gerber.

MR. SHAIN ANDERSON: Thank you, President Byford and thank you to the board for being here. My question is around Access-A-Ride, so first of all, I was heartened to hear of your commitment to fix Assess-A-Ride, that's great. But number one,

as we all know, Assess-A-Ride is just simply, is a level of service that folks that don't use it would just not tolerate. So number one, would you commit, President Byford to making Access-A-Ride on demand and number to, would you commit to when you expand the pilot program, being sure that the people that are on the wait list for the pilot program get on the pilot program to use it overall? And number three, sir, you've mentioned training around people with disabilities. I would also just ask that you remember that a lot of folks with disabilities do not have purely physical impairments but they can also have invisible disabilities as well, which is that, so just be sure that will you make Access-A-Ride on demand for folks, thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. So I'm going to ask Alex to deal with some of the detail, but I think I should deal with sort of the big picture incident. By the way, I deliberately didn't qualify the training. It's sensitivity training. It's not qualified. I didn't say for physical impairment, but I will let Alex talk to that a bit more.

Let me just say this one thing. I can't commit here and now to just a blank check for on demand. There are certain practical limitations on that. But we have gone into this e-hail pilot because we genuinely want to give people the independence and the spontaneity of being able to call up and it's been hugely

successful, way more successful than even we thought it would be. So I just ask you to bear with us, that there are some limitations. We have to just, for practical considerations, we must take into effect, but that topic has a long way to go. So we are actively looking into a phase two of the e-hail pilot. And with that, I'll ask Alex to toss in more detail.

MR. ELEGUDIN: Sure, and I'll actually answer your questions in reverse order. As President Byford said, the training is an ADA sensitivity and disability etiquette training across the board for all employees, how to interact with persons with disabilities. In terms of the training and in terms of every decision that I'm involved in at New York City transit, across buses, subways and Access-A-Ride, I always view the decisions from a perspective of four categories of disabilities, which is people with mobility impairments, those who use wheelchairs, those who are hearing impaired, those who are visually impaired, and those who may have cognitive or intellectual disabilities. And we are always, every decision we're making is, at least since I've been there, in those four categories. And also including representatives and advocates from those communities who, you know, I myself have a physical disability, but I may not know how it works, what is best for someone else with a different kind of disability, so making sure

that we're engaging the community as we make those decisions.

In terms of the e-hail pilot, you asked a very good question. It's something that we talk about every day in transit, to find a way, to find a way to make this pilot something that works throughout our Access-A-Ride system. There are significant challenges. One of the reasons that we're doing a pilot is we're trying to learn. We have seen that there are certain capacity rates in taxis that they're not able to handle. Right now, we have about 1,200 people in the on-demand pilot and we still don't see full or always completion rates. As you know, the Access-A-Ride program is an ADA paratransit program. We must meet our ADA statute requirements of zero denials in fulfilling trips. So what that ultimately means is we have to keep studying to see what taxis can handle, how our customers use the trips and also, as you also know, taxis are not in every part of this city. There are certainly big gaps, big geographic gaps where we see very little taxi density, you know, how would somebody get a trip there. So we have to address all of those things.

In terms of your question about the wait list, we're looking into that. But I'll be very candid with you that one thing right now, the 1,200 users have been signed up on a kind of an ad hoc basis while we were trying to figure out -- we were trying to figure out can this work, can taxis provide

paratransit service, and as we've seen, sure they can, and they can do a pretty good job. But the 1,000 -- the 1,200 users who we have in the program now are very, very active users. And we want to provide that service to them, but ultimately it's not a true representation of the Access-A-Ride customer base. There is 50,000 or so zero users, meaning customers who don't any trips, there are very low end users who don't use Access-A-Ride a lot, and as we go to phase two of the pilot, we want to make sure we have a pilot test group that is truly representative of the kids of users that Access-A-Ride has so we can really understand the costs, the operational contingencies and other elements. So I'm giving you as much of an honest answer as I can, but believe me, we are working diligently to expand this program. Thank you.

MR. BERMAN: Thanks, Alex.

MR. DAVID PAUL GERBER: Good evening everyone, good evening, Mr. Byford. Hi. We spoke, I have one other question. We spoke about the placard abuse, obstructing bus lanes and bus stops. I keep talking at MTA community meetings. My suggestion for you is you observe something like that, try reporting it to 311, to the NYPD and see if they'll come and maybe they might give you a false answer, telling you they took action when the vehicles are still illegally blocking a bus stop. Don't be surprised, because I keep saying placard abuse on Twitter and I

also contribute to placard abuse. It always happens all the time.

Now, for the Queens people, Queens Boulevard is a mess on weekends. I never ride it, but I know it's a mess. Why can't the R train end at Queens Plaza and make the E and F continuously run local or express as needed, so this way, it would eliminate the bottleneck at Forest Hills, by terminating the R at Queens Plaza --

MR. BERMAN: Thirty seconds.

MR. GERBER: -- it's its own line allowing to discharge and relay in the center track. By terminating at Forest Hills, as is, it shares the same track as the E and F. Why not just make the R terminate at Queens Plaza and implement MetroCards to be used on a Jamaica line railroad line between Jamaica and Manhattan, so to encourage use and take off the pressure.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. So I'll comment on the first one, and perhaps at the end, Sarah Wyss would like to comment on the second. I'll give my general view. On the issue of placard of abuse. Yeah, I ride buses, I ride transit every day. I've never owned a driving license, never had a driving license in my life. I use public transit, I rely on public transit. But I, so I do ride buses and I see people constantly blocking bus lanes. And what's not acceptable is it's not just delivery trucks, it's not

just private vehicles, it is city agencies. In some cases, it's our own transit --

MR. GERBER: Exactly.

MR. BYFORD: -- vehicles. So we're on the case. That has to change and certainly I think we should put our own house in order as part of that thrust. In terms of the specific, the suggestion you made, let me just give you one general observation, and perhaps Sarah would like to add to it. I mentioned earlier in response to a question from the council member that we're looking at things from a fresh perspective. As an outsider, someone new to New York, on the one hand, I think we're so lucky because we have a system that is unbelievably flexible. You know, it's got problems, it's got challenges, it needs to be modernized. But it's very, it brings joy to my heart as a railway man to have so many crossovers and to have so many route options that you can pretty much do every move, albeit there's some limitations on divisions. So that's the upside. If you have a train break down, for example, you can get around it pretty easily because there are lots of options. The downside is if you have a delay, the delays tend to get spread through the systems very quickly.

So, to your point, I think what's needed here is a fresh look. And I've asked one of my very senior people, very

knowledgeable people in subways to look at how can we simplify the train plan and look suggestions just like the one you just made. Are there things that we could do that don't require new signaling, but that would just make the train plan work more simply and effectively. Sarah, is there anything you want to add?

MS. SARAH WYSS: No, I really can't add anything.

MR. BYFORD: So, okay. But on your point, we're looking at every aspect of subway operations. We want to retain the benefit for you, but equally, in my professional opinion, as a 29 year railway man, I think that the train plan sometimes works against us. But we'll take a look at that.

MR. GERBER: Thank you very much.

MR. BYFORD: Same as we will with the point that came up about the Rockaways. We're going to take a fresh look at it.

MR. BERMAN: Robert and Michael Acevedo. They are signed up together to speak, so.

MR. ROBERT AND MICHAEL ACEVEDO: Hello. The problem we're having is, hi, Alex, we, he rides the subway with an elevator. Finds out it's not in service when he gets to the station. Very upsetting, then we have to go back on the train, get to the accessibility area, which is further down than where the elevator is, which I don't know why that happens. It should be

with the, when you get off the train, the elevator should be right there. We have to go 900 miles to get to the elevator. That's another thing. The problem is we have to go back on the train, go two stations down, and then walk back to where we're at. I don't think that's right. Can't you put up on the thing that's computerized, can't you put up when there's an elevator outage on that thing? Could that be done quicker than waiting for you to do all that Fast Forward stuff?

MS. MEYER: It can. I just wanted to talk to that specifically, which is we are creating a new information system on what we call our digital urban panels, which are the screens that you see next to the elevators or above the stairs. And it's going to have a ticker that's going to give more information about elevator outages. So we're expecting that in the next two months.

MR. ACEVEDO: On the subway itself? Because you know when you're riding the train, it doesn't say that. It should be on the subway, when you're on the trains, oh, I can't get off, I don't have to go get off the train and go wait for another train. That's what I'm talking about.

MS. MEYER: Noted. So some train cars are more modern than others. We know that.

MR. ACEVEDO: Yes, but that should be there.

MS. MEYER: And there are some communications systems we're working with and content management systems that we're setting up so that we can start putting messages on the train cars.

MR. ACEVEDO: And just one more question since the bus person is here.

MR. BERMAN: One last question.

MR. ACEVEDO: Yes.

MR. BERMAN: Ten seconds. I feel like a shot clock cop, right at a basketball game.

MR. ACEVEDO: The B35 bus in Brooklyn, we go to access, the B35 is terrible. I've got into fights on that bus. They're all crowded even though you have a limit.

MR. BERMAN: Please wrap up. We're running low, sorry.

MR. ACEVEDO: Even though there's a limited, can you see what could be done about that bus?

MS. WYSS: Absolutely. Actually we are looking at adding to the B35 bus coming in September will be brand new, articulated buses. This will be the first articulated bus out of that depot. I think that is going to help a whole lot with the issues of crowding that you're seeing on the bus. The longer buses, that's correct.

MR. BYFORD: Articulated buses, just while we're setting up with the next questioner, let me just make one other point,

please. You made the point there, can we do some things immediately and not wait for all this Fast Forward stuff. My plea to all of you is we need to do both. And that's why in the presentation, I made a point of saying you don't have to wait five years, you don't have to wait ten years. Some stuff we can and should get on with right now. There are basic things in this transit system that in my opinion should have been done years ago that actually in some cases don't cost any money, but just require better management attention. But having said, we can't fix everything overnight. You please do just have to bear with us. I'm a great believer in what I call quick wins. Sarah believes in quick wins, Alex believes in quick wins. There's stuff that you're going to see very shortly. We're working our way through quick wins while we sort the big bucks stuff out.

MR. ELEGUDIN: So, I just want to address a couple of the other elevator questions you had asked. One of the questions you asked is about elevator placement on the platform. That is a particularly challenging, especially in underground stations. What you have to understand as we do studies and as we look at where to place an elevator, most of the engineering kind of drawings give you an option of sometimes one, maybe two places, because those elevators have to pop up above ground. So you're talking about real estate, you're talking about buildings. Also

between the ground and the subway platform, there's all kinds of utility lines and water mains and all these different things. Our goal is to always place elevators as close to the accessible boarding area, which we consider the area near the conductor where we also have the slightly elevated platform by three inches.

As engineering allows, we try to accomplish that. In the same vein, we are always looking at how to install ramps. As we look at future stations, we are doing studies on when that's possible. It's incredibly challenging for underground stations because platforms are narrow, it's difficult to take up that much real estate in a station, but particularly for some elevated stations, maybe.

You also asked about elevator outages. We are doing a top to bottom review of how we deal with elevator outages. One, addressing communication, making sure customers know in real time. We're reviewing all of our maintenance practices, how quickly emergency teams respond, how many maintainers we have. We're also looking at remote technology, remote diagnostics on all of our elevators, so when an elevator goes down, we are notified as quickly as we can be, and not just notified of an outage, but notified of the exact problem as to why the elevator went down, so when the emergency team arrives, they know exactly

what they're working on. And we've seen pretty significant improvement in terms of regaining up time on elevators recently. We're also looking into elevator cleanliness, and not only are we increasing the number of ADA stations we have, we're consistently replacing old elevators. And we've seen with new elevators, there's significant improvements in reliability, accountability and the technology that they have to tell us. So, again, on every level of elevators, we are doing what we can to make sure that we achieve as close to as we can to full time up time on elevators.

MR. BERMAN: Thank you, Alex. So it has passed 8:00 and formal registration has closed. We do have several more speakers so I'm going to ask you to forgive me when I'm relentless about enforcing timelines moving forward. And I'm also going to say that for our panelists as well. As thorough and wonderful as the answers have been, we've just got to get to everyone. So I want to make sure, did Kevin Sealy speak earlier? I feel like I may have missed -- you did speak, okay, great. Okay. So Jason Pinero and Chris Greif are next up.

MR. JASON PINERO: Good evening. A couple of things I want to issue President Byford. One particular commuter from Queens addressed to me via Twitter, why not extending the Q60 up to 1:00 a.m. because it takes over two hours commuting on the F

train from Manhattan to Queens and one other thing is, is Kew Gardens to Union Turnpike going to be renovated, because this station, it is a disgrace. And one other thing is regarding accessibility, Alex, you're doing a good job, I have high confidence on you as well as Sarah. And regarding buses, I live near the Atlantic Avenue Barclays Center terminal. When are we going to stop seeing these dollar vans invading Flatbush Avenue?

MR. BYFORD: Okay. So, Sarah Wyss, perhaps you could just comment on the Q60 for a second.

MS. WYSS: We're happy to look into the span of service of the Q60. As far as the dollar vans are concerned, I agree with you. We have dollar vans, it's a big problem here in Jamaica and it's also a problem along Flatbush Avenue in Brooklyn and a few other sites in Brooklyn, where they are often driving in an unsafe manner, they are picking up at bus stops, which they are specifically not allowed to do and this is something that we need to work with the city and in addition we do need to work on our bus service, how do we get our bus service to a point where it is much more preferable to take than the dollar vans. One way to do that is to start getting the bus service moving a lot faster and a lot more reliably than it currently it.

MR. PINERO: Thanks, Sarah. One last thing --

MR. BERMAN: Ten seconds.

MR. PINERO: -- what are we going to do about those people who beat the fare in the subway system? Are we going to get the NYPD fully involved in this? Or what are we going to do about it because we are losing [unintelligible] [01:31:33] money because of this.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. In answer to your question about the station, all the stations will be renovated if we get the funding for the corporate plan, so 150 per five years, so that's 300 over ten years. Fare evasion, it is a hot topic. It's not unique to here. It is particularly prevalent, particularly in certain areas. I am regularly speaking with the police chief and we're looking at additional signage and ideally, tougher penalties for fare evasion. It's not acceptable that some people get free fares off the back of honest New Yorkers who form the majority, so we're not going to tolerate it. Thank you, Jason.

MR. PINERO: Thank you, President, and we'll see you guys in September.

MR. BYFORD: Most certainly.

MR. BERMAN: See you at the board meeting. Chris.

MR. CHRIS GREIF: And, for the record, it's Greif.

MR. BERMAN: Oh.

MR. GREIF: I cause grief. Anyway, I'm Christopher D. Greif from New York City Transit member, member of the New York City

Transit Riders Council and also a very supporting advocate for the Fast Forward program. I am really pleased to see this Fast Forward program going through. But as we hear today, and I'm glad the presses are here today to hear this clearly, because some press don't get the right information in. There are times, sometimes people, I'm not going to say everyone, there are people do listen, but we don't get right information out there. We need to work on our information very strongly and our elected official who said earlier about the freedom ticket, it's the Atlantic ticket that is being used right now along the Queens Village and Rosedale branch lines all the way into Brooklyn. And we, as the Transit Riders Council and PCAC have been working on this very hard. We're big supporting of the big band clubs up there, we're really a big support of this --

MR. BERMAN: Thirty seconds.

MR. GREIF: -- and I hope we can work on more accessibility and more Access-A-Ride vehicles, so if our elected officials are still here, we need your help. The MTA needs your help, Byford needs your help and Alex and the ladies up there too, thank you.

MR. BYFORD: The Sarahs. Chris, all I'll say is thank you, we enjoy and we value very much our work with PCAC and I'll look forward to coming to another meeting with you against shortly.

MR. GREIF: Thank you, sir.

MR. BERMAN: Okay. Mildred and Mildred Moton and Philip Roncoroni. Pardon me if I've butchered anyone's name.

MS. MILDRED MOTON: Hi. I'm glad that you, you've only been here for seven months, right?

MR. BYFORD: Mm-hmm.

MS. MOTON: So I would like to know, you was talking about this funding for this project. Well I want you to know to talk to Cuomo because my electric bill, my gas bill, my phone bill, my cable bill, MTA taxes are being taking out. So, now that's for everybody. So imagine how much money that is and you're not receiving it. So I need you to look at that. Do anybody know about that funds?

MR. BYFORD: Well, funding is a matter for government at all levels. It's also a matter for the board. I see my job as drawing up the plan, which we've now done, and making a compelling case for that plan. I leave the actual funding mechanism and the sources of funding to way smarter people than me. All I know is we need money, we need it predictably, we need lots of it, and we need it pretty much if not now, we certainly need it from next year. We really need this plan if it's to succeed. So rest assured I'll be lobbying very hard on your behalf.

MS. MOTON: Good. Look up that money.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you.

MR. PHILIP RONCORONI: Good evening, and thank you for the correct pronunciation. I sometimes get Ricearoni. There are three quick things I'd like to hopefully address. The first is with the modernization of the bus system, you are currently doing the Bronx. Queens, after Staten Island is the least subway accessible borough. I would hope that Queens is prioritized after the Bronx. There are vast subway deserts throughout Queens. Queens was also the last borough to get bus time. Secondly, I have concerns about the dashboard metrics because the dashboard metrics combine both the regular schedules and the supplement schedules. And just as a bit of background, supplement schedules for the audience are basically modified schedules to accommodate things like track work. But in an extreme situation and to do easy math, let's say you normally run ten trains per hour, but due to a supplement schedule, you are running one train per hour, and that train actually runs, my understanding is that your metrics would show that as 100 percent service delivered. That's disingenuous. You've actually delivered ten percent service, not 100 percent.

And finally, as you continue to repair things, it's not a popular opinion but especially during the overnight hours, when ridership is much lower, other transit systems like SF Muni,

have owl bus systems which are basically are just bus routes that parallel the subway routes. And I know from experience --

MR. BERMAN: If you could just start wrapping up, that'd be great.

MR. RONCORONI: -- sometimes, it's quicker to take the Q60 down Queens Boulevard at 2:00 a.m. rather than a local train down Queens Boulevard that is constantly stopping due to track gangs and other such maintenance.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. Thank you. So in terms of the priority of the remaining borough reviews, that's something that we will need to discuss with the various borough presidents, but I hear you about Queens and good for you for sticking up for your borough. Dashboard metrics, my view is very simple. Accountability is telling the truth. And absolutely, we should be presenting facts through the dashboards. But equally, I don't think it's right that we should, if I'm understanding you correctly, present something that if we've actually changed the timetable via a supplementary plan because we're doing work that will benefit you, well we should still be saying what the facts are about that alternative plan rather than planning to fail by still targeting ourselves against what was originally planned. But dashboards are meant to be open and transparent means by which you can judge us and we have rolled out a lot of

dashboards recently, we'll continue to work on them.

The owl bus is a bit similar to the TTC night bus. We do have overnight buses. I take your point. Going forward, as this plan kicks in, we've really got to excel at giving you alternatives. So that point noted, thank you.

MR. RONCORONI: Thank you.

MR. BERMAN: Bilal Karriem and Stephan Bauman.

MR. STEPHEN BAUMAN: I was told in my engineering courses that something that cannot be measured quantitatively does not exist. Could you attach specific numbers to the service level capacity, trains per hour, minimum headway for each line that is proposed to receive CBCT. How does this compare quantitatively to the service level capacity possible with the current signal system, in numbers?

MR. BYFORD: No, I can't do that right now. What I can -- because we haven't yet specified the exact type of CBCT we'll be using and when looking at the individual routes, there are different idiosyncrasies for each of them. But broadly, so I can only give you a broad answer, broadly, you see an uplift in both reliability because there is way less line side equipment, you don't have train stops, you don't have train trip clocks, you don't have air systems, you don't rely on signal trees. You take most of that equipment out, you use transponders on tracks and

you use means by which the trains communicate to each other, as I suspect you know.

And then the second benefit is an uplift in capacity. So if the Tube is any comparator, where the London Underground was typically running 25, 27 per hour, now on the Jubilee, the Northern and the Victoria lines, they're running 36 trains per hour. And that's got to be our aspiration. But the specifics will be worked out as we negotiate with the contractors which system we're going to use and what is the maximum that we can run.

MR. BAUMAN: I did present to you a while back what the service levels were back in the '40s and '50s and it was roughly between 30 and 40 trains per hour on every line.

MR. BERMAN: We're really got to keep moving.

MR. BYFORD: What has happened since then, but certainly the whole point, there's no point in me turning the clock back and looking back. I'm looking forward. And what we're aiming to do is exponentially improve both the reliability and the capacity of this system to give you modern signaling.

MR. BAUMAN: Thanks.

MS. BILAL KARRIEM: Welcome to Southeast Queens.

MR. BYFORD: It's good to be here.

MS. KARRIEM: Okay. So in your presentation, a couple of

things, you talked about 2,800 electric buses that will be coming. I want to know how many of those will be allocated to Southeast Queens. Secondly, in the presentation, you showed a number of bus lines that the service has increased. And one of them was the Q6. Not true. I have lived along the Q6 line 40 of my 55 years of life on this planet and it isn't true. And I want to talk about the Q6 specifically, because the Q6 runs to JFK Airport. And we are not talking about, and I'm so glad that my state senator, James Sanders is here, because I want to talk a little bit about JFK and all that is proposed to come to JFK and talk about the AirTrain. I take the subway every day. There are thousands of people utilizing the AirTrain to get from JFK airport to the subway and into Manhattan or their other destinations. And there is no attention being paid to that hub, which is one of the most populous hubs along the East Coast. JFK is the introduction to the United States for many people. I also notice a number of people, travelers, utilizing the Q6 line --

MR. BERMAN: Ten seconds.

MS. KARRIEM: So I want you to, I'm telling you that is not true because I take the Q6 line and please look into the Q6 line that AirTrain, the Sutphin Boulevard subway station, and please speak to my state senator at how all of this is going to be put together with all of this major development that's soon to come

to JFK.

MR. BYFORD: Sure, thank you. I'll ask Sarah to talk to Q6, because we listed that as an improvement, so I'm hoping that was the case, Sarah.

MS. WYSS: So, as one of the, as part of the Fast Forward plan, one of the things we are doing is adding service off-peak to certain routes. Q6 will be one of the first to get this. This will happen on September 2nd, September 2nd, the day before Labor Day.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. And then you made, you asked me about electric buses. You'll notice I said 2,800 more buses. I didn't actually say 2,800 more electric buses. Our aim, our desire, our stated desire, as part of Fast Forward is to progressively move to a carbon neutral fleet. So that might be CNG, which is compressed natural gas. It might be electric. But we're not committing to that until we're certain that the technology works properly in our climate, very hot, very cold. There are very few properties out there successfully using fully electric vehicles yet.

But that's our intention to progressively move to an all electric fleet if we can get the technology right, which is not just the buses, but it's also about the charging technology and we believe that an all electric fleet for the biggest bus fleet

in North America is potentially possible by 2035, 2040. But going forward, the first batch of buses may or may not be electric, it just depends on what the technology is by the suppliers that we will be talking to. I want those buses. And I just answered that. No, what I said was the 2,800 buses, they're not going to be all electric. What we're wanting to do, we're trialing buses at the moment, we're trialing electric buses, we're trialing the technology. You won't thank me if we go out and buy a whole bunch of buses that don't work properly. So I can't say specifically yet. What we are saying is we will buy new buses as and when the technology is proven to be reliable, they will progressively be the buses that you want and I want too.

MR. BERMAN: Okay. Juan Castillo and Omar Vera.

MR. JUAN CASTILLO: I'd just like to make this quick [unintelligible] [01:45:10]. Is it possible, you plan to renovate every subway line stop. Under similar plans based on the Enhanced Station Initiative, or that you might redesign every subway line would mean changes. Like if you're working with Trump, the Trump Administration on building these two and three, or the Second Avenue subway simultaneously. And earlier today, you talked about CBCTs for every subway line in four boroughs. Is it possible to include the Staten Island Railway

and will you plan to add Wi-Fi to all other outdoor subway stations?

MR. BYFORD: The renovation, I mean there's different ways that we renovate stations. In some cases, they have been via the Enhanced Station Initiative, the ESI. In some cases, we go in and do what's called component renewal, where there are specific things that are worn out that need to be replaced, but the rest of the station's okay. In other cases, it's a comprehensive, complete station renewal. So it really depends on the prevailing state of the station. But what we are committing to, as long as we get the funding, is that over the ten years of this plan, 300 stations will be comprehensively modernized. And that doesn't mean aesthetics. That means rebuilding them so they're fit for purpose.

CBTC, Staten Island Railway no, not initially. That will be one that will be further out in the plan, but what the Staten Island Railway will get is new trains. We've already got new Kawasaki trains on order and the Staten Island Railway will be beneficiaries of those new trains. But ultimately, I would like to see this whole subway, including the Staten Island Railway renovated and resignaled. And wi-fi, Sarah, please?

MS. MEYER: Sure. I'm actually not sure what the plan is for Wi-Fi is in outdoor stations, so I'll follow up and I'll

post that on our Twitter account, so you can read it there.

MR. CASTILLO: Alright.

MS. MEYER: Alright. Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you.

MR. OMAR VERA: Do I have to say it? Alright. Good evening.

MR. BYFORD: Good evening, Omar. Nice to see you.

MR. VERA: New York City now has the latest superhero.

MR. BYFORD: Just a railway man.

MR. VERA: Anyway, I do like, I like this plan. I've seen it like since May. It's like it's so perfect. You're bar raising everything from top to bottom. I like to literally do the action while I'm saying things. What I was going to say was that you had a similar plan like in Toronto, right?

MR. BYFORD: Mm-hmm.

MR. VERA: And it was good. It was accompanied with the York Spadina extension. Well, now you're here in the city, could you do like this plan I've been long awaiting to extend the C train to Lefferts Boulevard and have all A services to the Rockaways. That should be, I wrote this in my letter to you back in January, in the winter time.

MR. BYFORD: Yeah. Okay. So Omar, first of all, it's a pleasure to see you. I want whatever you're on. You're a man of lots of energy. That question came up earlier. We are having a

look at that. It is something that people regularly comment to me that we could simplify things by running the As all the way around to the Rockaways and running the Cs to Lefferts Boulevard. So we are looking at that. It is one of many things on the to-do list and I think it is, it falls into the category potentially of quick wins. I do need to make sure before I stand up here and commit, that there aren't compelling reasons and they'll have to be compelling, that I don't know about, that will preclude such a move. At face value, it sounds sensible.

MR. VERA: Fair enough. And all in all, this looks pretty much good, indeed. You're going to make the MTA great again. I know you are.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you, Omar.

MR. VERA: All my colleagues are cheering on you.

MR. BERMAN: Next up David Roth and George Kaufer. And let's actually do three now, because we've really got to get moving. Richardo Beaussejour, so David, George and Richardo.

MR. DAVID ROTH: Thank you for hearing me today. So my mom is blind and I think that to be truly accessible, the subway needs to be safe. According to your signage, 50 people a year are getting hit and killed by subways, 170 I think, well, whatever the sign that I saw in the subway today, in 2015, were hit by subways, causing major amputations. I was very, I felt

compelled to come here today because in your plan to modernize, you're not taking it to a platform edge safety into your plan. There's no, there is a method to prevent, I think since 2013 there's been about, until today, if it's 50 a year, that's 500 deaths, excuse me, 750 deaths. And if this plan is going to go forward ten more years without platform edge doors, there's going to be another 500 deaths, and you can stop it because at the AirTrain, as you know, there's zero, nobody's been hit by a car, nobody's been amputated, nobody's been killed. And I can't let my mom go on the subway. And even if you get escalators and you get elevators, she's not going down there, because as you know, in London, they put them in. In Tokyo, in Toronto, I think there's just an add that they're going to put them in when one person died. What's your plan to protect them? Because modernization includes safety.

MR. BYFORD: So I agree with you, with that statement, I entirely concur. And I say that as a former safety director on what was British Rail. So safety is in my psyche, it's in my DNA. I'm very familiar with platform screen doors. There are certain real, genuine challenges about retrofitting an existing metro system, one that was built in the early 1900s. So when you mentioned London, the oldest network in the world, the only platform screen doors on the London Underground are on the

Jubilee line extension from Westminster around to Stratford because they were brand new stations that were built with dead straight platforms and platforms that can support the weight of platform screen doors.

So I'm not ruling them out. I would certainly say that they are easier to specify and my view would be we should specify them for extensions and modern stations going forward. To retrofit them where literally the platforms will not support the weight and where there are very, very tight curves, and where you don't have automatic train control, so you'd have to have very accurate train stopping to line the trains up with the doors is -- I'm not saying it's insurmountable, but I think it will probably double the cost of the Fast Forward Plan.

So in the short term, that's why that's not in the plan. I would love to have platform screen doors. They don't just preclude suicides. They preclude garbage blowing onto the tracks, they stop people dropping things and then going down to pick them up. So I get it. But it is, trust me, way more complex than you might think. The only subway that I can think of that has retrofitted an existing system is Hong Kong, which is a system built in 1976, again, with straight platforms. So it's on my wish list, but realistically there are huge challenges.

MR. ROTH: Thank you for your response and it was before

your time, but Second Avenue subway doesn't have them.

MR. BYFORD: And they could have. I'm well aware of that.
Thank you.

MR. GEORGE KAUFER: Good evening. I'm George Kaufer. I'm with the Mariners Harbor Civic Association. I'm just saying you skipped me and kept putting people in front of me. That's not right. And I'm just saying --

MR. BERMAN: I promise you I didn't skip you, I swear, George.

MR. KAUFER: Whatever. So going to the thing of the comment of there's only a few people don't benefit and the vast majority benefit, the X17 is the busiest express route on the island and especially in weekday ridership and you completely destroyed it with slower service and less frequent service, so that's just, you know. But going to the point, every, that report should have included a bunch of data, a bunch of tables, so at the very least you can say no, George, you're going crazy and this is the amount that benefit, this is the amount of riders that don't benefit, these are the complaints you receive, these are the compliments you receive, this, that. And I see nothing. I see a little PowerPoint or whatever it is. And just for the record, after I go to this, I gotta catch the last SIM8 when I used to be able to go downtown and have frequent service available on

the 17, I'm not going to be able to fit on, I'm not going to even bother trying. There should have also been for, did off-peak really need to be downtown and midtown?

MR. BERMAN: Ten seconds.

MR. KAUFER: You should had a vote or whatever it is because you completely screwed downtown, you completely screwed the off-peak. Any comments or whatever it is?

MR. BYFORD: Okay. Thank you, George. And just in case people didn't make the connection, what George is talking about, the recently launched redesign of the Staten Island Express bus network, which started two days ago. It started on, today's Tuesday, right, it started on Sunday. And I was over there on the island. That redesign was informed by Staten Islanders. Staten Islanders did not, they told us the so-called express network hadn't been reviewed for decades. People criticized it, vehemently criticized it for being circuitous, for taking 27 stops on average to even get off the island and for going on a rather circuitous route around Manhattan and being held up and horrendously late. So we designed it based on customers' feedback. Is it perfect yet? No. Are we still able to tweak it? Yes. And even tonight, we are finalizing a list that is going to be published on our website, which will list out the changes we've already made since Sunday to address customers' concerns.

What I would say is you can't please everyone. In any bus redesign, there will some people who love it, and there will some people who are not so happy. What we aimed to do was to improve service for the majority. But my commitment standing here today in a public forum is we will not rest until we've addressed each and every one of the complaints. We will certainly at the very least get an explanation as to what we've done and why we've done it. And even today, there's a list going up of changes we've already made.

MR. KAUFER: Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you.

MR. RICHARDO BEAUSSEJOUR: How you doing? Thank you for having this town hall meeting. My first suggestion is the information to get this town hall meeting out. So I guess like with the flyers that you put around, so like there is a subway change or whatever, a route change, you could do the same thing for these town hall meetings. Put them on the routes where you think people will be seeing them more often, maybe around [unintelligible] [01:57:13] Boulevard, on some of the buses. That way you could get at least a bigger audience and more people to have an input. The same with the live streaming, you should actually probably be doing something like that as well.

But one of my questions is with this whole new plan and

this idea to modernization the system, some of the countdown clocks, one the aspects of modernization, are placed in a very awkward location on the platforms, particularly on the A train lines where the platforms are about 600, 700 feet long, and there will be just one in the middle of the station. I've seen on lines, on the L trains where the stations are much shorter and they have two or sometimes three countdown clocks.

MR. BERMAN: Ten seconds.

MR. BEAUSSEJOUR: I find that a little bit weird and I feel like that's also a waste of money and I just want to know if there's any way that we can actually have people who can speak out about that and get some feedback.

MR. BERMAN: Thank you.

MS. MEYER: I agree with you. We definitely need more countdown clocks. And they are, we're actually installing new customer information screens that will be at the -- before you swipe your card to make sure that you know, right, do I have time to get a cup of coffee or do I have to run for the train. So those are being installed right now in Brooklyn. We're moving to every borough and they'll be, I believe the screens will all be installed by the end of 2019. So we're making significant strides at making sure that you guys all have the information you need to make the best decision about your travel.

The countdown clocks, some of them were placed where there was you know, electrical power and it's hard to see some of them. So we think that making sure we have these dedicated screens before you swipe in will solve that. There will also be, we are converting all of the advertising posters that you see on the platforms, those are all going to be digital screens moving forward. We can take those screens over there are disruptions and let you know what the issue is. So over the next couple of years, you'll start to see significant improvements in the way that we distribute information so you can make the best decision for your travel.

MR. BYFORD: May I just add to that, though? I think you make a really good point and I'd just like to illustrate what we mean, as your new team, the team trying to turn things around for you, what we mean by customer led thinking, which is, okay, I get it, that for some reason the countdown clock was put where the electrical power is. But what's the point if it's not where the customers can use it? So we're trying to change that mindset would be move the electrical source, right. Put in a conduit and put it where the customer needs it. Again, it's going to take a bit of time. But that's the mindset now at New York City Transit.

MR. BERMAN: Mark Henry and Manuel Martinez and also

Annette Harris. We'll do three of you.

MR. MARK HENRY: Good evening, President Byford and the panel at large. My name is Mark Henry, I'm president and business agent of Local 1056 out here in Queens and we service basically the bus service here in Southeast Queens.

MR. BYFORD: Mm-hmm.

MR. HENRY: Again, it's an ambitious plan that you have presented to this audience. I'm not going to critique because mainly it's based around funding. You know, whenever that funding comes through, I know then you could probably move forward a lot of your agenda. But embedded in your plan, I did want to find out, you did mention briefly at the very end of your presentation about Jamaica Depot. And is it included in your five year forward plan as one of the items that kind of sticks out because bus service on this side of Queens is, it's more than necessary. This is a transit desert for mainly everybody out here that we pick up and service out here.

The other thing that was also mentioned in your presentation was about the Q43 and the positive, the traffic control, that system does not work on the Q43. I have a few operators here that do work those lines and it is not operational. The bus might have the transponders on it, but as far as it operating, it does not happen. The other thing, which

would be a quick fix is you have a portion of your fleet that has, is fairly new, but it doesn't have automated announcements, which is something that's huge --

MR. BERMAN: If you could wrap it up, that'd be great.

MR. HENRY: -- needed up there. I understand. That's hugely needed out here. The other thing is of course, we had talked about this, or as I've heard in the conversation is about enforcement with DOT. We need Transit's muscle with the DOT and the NYPD out here. You made the trip out here, and took the J line out, and when you came out at Parsons and Archer you probably were surprised by what you saw out there, because this is your first time out here. The number of vans that have taken over the network is inconceivable and they definitely need help with that. So it's really more statements than you [unintelligible] [02:02:59].

MR. BYFORD: Sure. But we'll just give you a quick -- first up, Mark, it's really nice to see you and my colleagues here today. I very much appreciate the worki Queens bus drivers do every day, day in, day out to deliver great service. Jamaica, by Jamaica, you mean the reconstruction of the depot, right?

MR. HENDRY: The reconstruction of the depot.

MR. BYFORD: Yes, that is. It's not overtly referenced in here, and there's lots of things not overtly referenced in that

plan because they're already in the capital plan of the MTA. So we didn't replicate everything in the MTA capital plan in the Fast Forward plan. But that, I can assure you, is still in that plan.

Secondly, the Q43 traffic signal priority, I'll ask Sarah to check that out then with DFT. Maybe it's not switched on yet, but there's no reason why that shouldn't be working, because what's the point of having it if it's not doing the job. Announcements, I was surprised when I came here that that's not already in place. It's certainly the norm on every bus and every streetcar in Toronto. It's already happening as specified by the Canadian equivalent of the ADA. So we do need to get onto that. And progressively as we rollout our new what's called CAD AVL system, we should get to be able make announcements.

[END 0821York1]

[START 0821York2]

MR. HENRY: Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you, Mark, good to see you.

MR. MANUEL MARTINEZ: Good evening. Thank you for coming to our community and speaking to us this evening. You basically have already spoken about capital improvements I guess with respect to Parsons and Archer station. The station is very dark, it's very dirty. It is very old, and we are looking, hoping that

those monies do come to this community in the very near future. I know I understand elevators are a priority around the system, but our station, as you can see, is dark and dingy and a depressing place to visit, as we make our commutes.

One thing I really wanted to request is when equipment is purchased, particular buses, I would ask that although I know the unions are consulted, but also within the union, also make an effort to consult the drivers because new buses are purchased and they do not have the best ingress and egress for the passengers. And also they're not the most comfortable for the operators, they don't have the best seating capacity. So we have new buses and they may work well for emissions and so forth, but they don't really do the job in terms of providing a comfortable ride people can get off and on in a timely manner.

MR. BYFORD: I totally agree. That's all I need say I think. I could not agree more that we should increasingly involved the user in designs and decisions. And in just recent weeks, we started having sort of mini town halls within transit, where I just sit and listen to what employees want to tell me. It's their session, and it's been such good feedback that I comment at the end, my colleagues on the exec are going to do the same, you will see progressively a much more inclusive transit. It's not my company, it's our company.

MR. MARTINEZ: Thank you, I appreciate that.

MR. BERMAN: Is Annette here? Okay. Great.

MS. ANNETTE HARRIS: Hi. I'm Annette Harris, and I take the E train from Parsons and Archer to work Monday through Friday and the homelessness problem in that subway is terrible. Homeless people stretched out on the benches, the cars smell horrible. Sometimes, you can't even get on the train. You have to wait for the next train to come into the station. And so I don't think it's fair to working people, we pay to ride the train, but yet it's filled with homeless people. So I wanted to know what can MTA do to alleviate that situation?

MR. BYFORD: I entirely agree. It's, the issue, being frank, is that it's more than an MTA problem, it's a societal problem. And, you know, we do try to humanely ask people to leave the trains or leave the stations. You know what happens when you do, they just come straight back in. And until and unless as a city, we tackle this situation holistically, particularly in the winter, people are going to just keep coming back in. And I, myself have asked people to move on. You know that they're not going to, or they might must get off the train and then get on the next train. We need to work with the city, which we do, the homeless, the outreach people, with PD, with the city, with social services to come up with decent, humane

alternative locations, so that we can with a good conscience and a clean conscience, ask people, sorry, insist actually to people that you cannot ride around on this system. It is, it's a real problem, I totally agree. I wish I had a magic wand. But we are going to just keep on this, with elected officials to find ways to get people to go somewhere else, where they can be looked after.

Just one statistic that we were told the other day by the people that do these interactions with homeless people. They said on average, they needed to have 500 interactions with an individual, before they can get them to move on. So it's a huge problem. I don't like it any more than you do. But we need to find a solution as a city, not just the MTA.

MR. BERMAN: Thanks. Yerushalam Wu, Dave Joel, Allan Smith.

MS. YERUSHALAM WU: Good evening. First, I just want to say I don't know who came up with the help line, but I use this constantly, so I just want to say thank you. For the bus, I don't know how much it costs, but I just don't think it can cost that much to have metal chairs on at least every other three bus stop, so every other three blocks, so people can at least sit down. And also some of them have those window glass booths, so some of them do not. And those that do not will have directions say two stops further to have, so you know, those kind of things

I don't think cost that much, but it's going to be so much helpful, especially in the cold, winter days.

Last thing, or two things, pay hike, there's going to be a pay hike, no matter how you put it. So I will appreciate it if you will advance, you know, at the token booth, tell ahead of time, just like this meeting, tell way ahead of time --

MR. BERMAN: Ten seconds.

MS. WU: -- so people can kind of prepare in their budget. With the new system of the payment, I just use the unlimited, and I got on bus, but when I swipe it for the selective bus, it got demagnetized, so --

MR. BERMAN: Please wrap it up, thank you. You can have one more comment, yes, go ahead.

MS. WU: Yeah, so I had to -- but so, so with the new payment system, I just hope that if there's a downtime, if it doesn't work or something, that we'll still be able to get wherever we have, go home or go to work on time. Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. Thank you for the comments, thank you for that feedback. Just a couple of comments from me. A fare hike, that's not decided yet. That's a matter for the MTA board. There would have to be public hearings. So that's not yet determined and yeah, that would have to be advertised well in advance. So watch this space and we'll see what happens with

that.

With regard to the new fare payment system, our aim is to make it very, very reliable, in other words, very high level of availability. Really, we should be looking north of 99 percent for the availability of the readers. So we're buying a proven product, a product that has been used, a system that's been used in Sydney and in London already, it's a really good system.

MR. ALLEN SMITH: Good evening. This is a quick fix, J line. I say J stands for jubilation. You may be aware that in the morning rush, the service from Queens community on the J line, for all intents and purposes, is almost entirely local. We have people in the Queens community of Richmond Hill Woodhaven, also City Line, Cypress Hills, East New York, that actually take the J train east to Jamaica to change for the E and the F to get to Manhattan rather than take the J line into Manhattan. You have two tracks in Queens, but you have three tracks in Brooklyn. Years ago, there was a local service that began either at Broadway Junction --

MR. BERMAN: You have 30 seconds.

MR. SMITH: -- or Atlantic Avenue that picked up all the local stops along the J line into Manhattan. And I'm wondering whether a service like that could be reinstated. That way the J line could go from Queens to Broadway Junction, skip all those

locals and get to Broadway and Myrtle and then get into Manhattan.

MR. BERMAN: Thank you.

MR. SMITH: Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you for the feedback. We have lots to consider, lots of service suggestions. As I said earlier, we're trying to look at things from a fresh perspective and a blank sheet of paper. We will add that to the to-do list. Thank you.

MR. DAVID JOEL: Mr. President, Q46, when will it be converted to SBS? The Q46 westbound local, please eliminate the bus stop at 190 Street and Union Turnpike. There's no need to had the bus stop at 190th and Union Turnpike and then stop again at 188 Street. Q17 local, Flushing to Jamaica, please eliminate the bus stop at Hillside and 187th Street. There's no need for the bus to stop at 188 and then stop again at 187th Street. It just slows things down.

The E train from 179th Street, in the morning, right now, it starts at 7:11, please start at 6:00 a.m. Start east service from 179th Street into Manhattan at 6:00 a.m. every 20 minutes, like it is now, every 20 minutes until 8:20. And that, the E, as you know, the E train is very popular from 179th Street, and it's historic.

MR. BERMAN: Thirty seconds.

MR. JOEL: And also, you mentioned the CBCT project on the E line. I'm thrilled about that. Please, during the construction, please ask the Long Island Railroad to cross honor MetroCards so that we can take the Long Island Railroad in when there's no east service.

MR. BERMAN: Ten seconds.

MR. JOEL: And, oh, the 7 Express, when the 7 CBCT project is completed, have the 7 Express run seven days a week, not just Monday through Friday. Thanks.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. So a lot raised there. I think probably the best is we just capture all those items and we feedback via the website.

MR. BERMAN: Yeah, I was just going to say you can also fill out a comment card. They're available up there, so if there some super hyper specific things, someone will respond to you, but try to use this as a Q&A format. Norine Wright, William Kregler, Laretta Humphrey, if you guys could approach the mics.

MS. NORINE WRIGHT: Good evening everyone. Thank you for coming to Queens. I'm from Queens Village, and I'm very happy about the Fast Forward, and it also pleased me to see the E and the F train up there that were in the first five years if I'm correct, and not the second five years. But I'm here to request better service on the Q46, excuse me, Q43 and the 36 and the 76,

specifically during the time rush hour, 6:00 a.m. in the morning and 7:45 a.m. Breathe in, I'm a little nervous.

MR. BERMAN: You're doing great.

MS. WRIGHT: Okay. Thank you. And the reason why, we have a lot of children to schools and it's crowded going to work in the morning and with schoolchildren and a lot of times, we can't get any seats. There's no seats for us at all. We just have to stand. And I think it's a nice idea if we could have that bus lane to express all the buses straight to 179th Street, that would be nice. That's a concern. And as far as the Q76, when I'm heading home during the rush hour, we'll see Q17 practically empty running, three buses will come by before one Q76, so I would like to know if you can add an additional 76 line running during rush hour between 5:00 and 7:00 p.m. So it's the morning time between 6:00 a.m. and 7:45, more buses. Maybe we can get the large buses that's around over here, to get more people on the bus. I would like that.

MR. BERMAN: Ten seconds.

MS. WRIGHT: Let me see, and just one more item I don't want to forget, overcrowding, the Q76, oh, and the booklet that you've been showing, do you have copies outside for us to have? The Fast Track booklet that you've been sending out?

MR. BYFORD: So the specifics, again, in the interest in

time, the specifics, it's better that we research your requests and we put an answer on the website. So we will answer all of these specifics where people say get rid of a bus stop, or add service. I think it's easier if we just take them away and we list our answers.

With regard to the book, you can get, you can access the plan via the website. So I'm trying not to cut down loads of forests by bringing loads of copies, but if you look on our website, the New York City -- it's on Fast Forward, right? Thank you very much, you know it better than me.

MR. BERMAN: FastForward.MTA --

[CROSSTALK]

MR. BYFORD: But on the MTA website.

MS. WRIGHT: Yes, I have that, I did write that down, thank you. And another thing, another situation.

MR. BYFORD: You can download it from there.

MS. WRIGHT: Yes, there's something I just recalled.

MR. BERMAN: We've really got to keep moving.

MS. WRIGHT: I work in New Jersey, I take the F train, then when you get to Union Turnpike, excuse me, I take the E train to get to Union Turnpike, the F train is there, and when they open up the door, they don't have the courtesy to wait for us to just run across and they --

MR. BERMAN: Please, just write these down. We've got like ten more speakers and we're already overtime.

MS. WRIGHT: Okay. Thank you for your time. I'll talk to you after, okay.

MR. BERMAN: Thank you so much. Michael, so yeah, there's a couple more, but also Michael Kimble, maybe we'll just try to keep moving people, so approach the mic because you'll be the next one after this batch.

MS. LAURETTA HUMPHREY: Yes, good evening. My name is Laretta Humphrey, Southeast Queens resident, I have just two comments here. The E station, the E train station on Parsons Boulevard is too hot, too hot in the summertime. I don't know if you could make a correction there. And also, I'm here on behalf of the people that take Access-A-Ride. Someone was saying that the recertification should be changed because if you're receiving Social Security disability, why should you have to reregister every year? It's almost a nuisance to them, maybe a five year, three year, something like that. And that's about it.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. Thank you. So with hot stations, it's not an easy thing to fix. The fact we have air conditioned trains, particularly someone coming from London where we don't, is nice. What we should be doing is giving you such a reliable train service that you really aren't waiting in a hot station

for very long. That's got to be our first objection. On the Access-A-Ride, Alex?

MR. ELEGUDIN: We are currently in the process of changing how recertification, reassessment works for Access-A-Ride. A lot more people will be moved to what we call continual eligibility, where you don't even have to reassess, they just check to make sure you're okay. Technically, the standards for Access-A-Ride eligibility and assessment are a little bit different than what the Social Security administration reviews, but for sure, people will be going less through reassessments after we reissue the policy. For most folks, it will help a lot.

MR. WILLIAM KREGLER: Okay. Good evening. My name is Bill Kregler, thank you very much for having me. I have some comments I hope you'll take as good advice. First and foremost, the transit authority has a lacking of proper oversight in all their projects. You don't keep them on time, you don't keep them on budget, and god knows you don't keep to completion what you started out to do in the first place. So that's the problem with the transit authority right off the bat. I don't know which miracle workers you're bringing with you on these projects, but that is your big problem.

Second I want to thank the young lady that pointed out about the homelessness. That you can correct. There's no such

thing as 500 interactions to get people off. I don't know where you got that idea from. Back in the days when Giuliani took it over as mayor, we had to clean out the graffiti, the homelessness, the beggars. Right now, you're inundated, inundated by beggars, aggressive beggars, homelessness, the stench besides everything else. You can correct that. You have, you know what, you're not getting the city services from the transit police. Just because you have guys in tactical outfits on Times Square standing there looking good is not good.

MR. BERMAN: Thirty seconds.

MR. KREGLER: Your job is to clean up the subway. You can do that, that's Fast Forward. That's exactly what you can do. Do that. And maybe what you should have done, maybe here's a question you would like answer, why didn't you jump all over the district attorneys who refused to prosecute turnstile jumpers, because how can you ask me then to pay my fare.

MR. BERMAN: Ten seconds.

MR. KREGLER: It's just going to go up because of these major projects and you're going to let people jump over. You should have jumped on those DAs. And another thing, this is a city transit thing.

MR. BERMAN: You've got to wrap it up, please.

MR. KREGLER: You've got all these MTA cops here. If

they're in your power, then use them to clean up the subway when the city fails to give you your services.

MR. BERMAN: Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. Thank you for the comments. With the on time, on budget, I entirely agree with you. The MTA, under the leadership of Chairman Lhota, has set up a task force where we are looking at what it is that in the past, I can't turn the clock back, been here seven months, what is it that is making us have these problems with various projects. So we're looking to streamline the procurement process, we're looking to better understand what are the cost drivers of our various projects. We're looking at what's within our gift to control and what is not. We're looking to get better at specifying projects, we're applying a CEO, an accountable CEO to each major project so we agree with you there. The norm going forward should be on time, on budget. Some projects do come in time on budget. The Myrtle Avenue viaduct is a good example.

Homelessness, again, I reiterate, it is not just an MTA issue. Similarly, with the DAs, we did push back against the DAs. The chairman wrote a pretty stringent letter to the DAs. Ultimately, we can't tell them what to do, we can only make a protest.

MR. BERMAN: So I think I called Michael Kimble and then

Alain Berrouet and David Kuprferberg could approach as well, just to keep things moving. There's about five or six more after that I think.

MR. DAVID KUPFERBERG: I'm David. Good evening. There has been recent discussion regarding providing reduced fares for low-income residents. However, some middle income residents, for whom unlimited passage do not make economic sense, or who take short trips, or require multiple fares to complete their trip also need relief from these fare hikes every two years. Half the riders do not have unlimited passes. Those are the ones who suffer from our present unfair policy and they should not be ignored. \$2.75 to travel less than a mile and another \$2.75 to return home is too expensive. The fact that those traveling from Tottenville in Staten Island to Pelham Bay Park in the Bronx pay that same amount makes little sense, and it's also unfair. Some systems do not make sense either for dense urban areas like this. But why should someone requiring three buses to make a short trip be punished further with an additional fare because of an outdated route structure that doesn't happen to serve his or her needs.

MR. BERMAN: Thirty seconds.

MR. KUPFERBERG: He's already being punished by having to wait for three buses. This is what I propose. Unlimited trips

for one fare if the time between entering the system and making your final transfer is no greater than 90 minutes, two hours if the initial is an express route. Any comments?

MR. BYFORD: Yes. Ultimately, anything is possible, ultimately you could have a free transit system, but someone still has to pay for that. So we have been working with the city. The city proposed the fare, the fare's policy. And as the MTA, we were very happy to accommodate it on one, sorry, two key conditions. One, that the MTA should not administer to that, the city agreed to that, the city administers it. And two, that the MTA should not be left with a hole in its budget because of the fact that discounts are being given. Even though we like the idea of discounts as a concept, I think they're laudable. But to leave a whole in the MTA's budget, that would only make matters worse. What we're trying to do is rebuilt this system and modernize it and give you what you want. But the more we chip away at the revenue base, the harder the challenge becomes. So I get your point about equity, but ultimately, somehow we still have to provide revenue streams for the MTA to keep going, and we need to provide more revenue streams to do what you and I both want, which is modernizing transit.

MR. KUPFERBERG: Thank you.

MR. BERMAN: I'm also going to ask Yvonne Jennings to come

down, just to really try to expedite as much as possible. Go ahead.

MR. ALAIN BERROUET: Hi, Alain Berrouet, concerned citizen from Southeast Queens. You know, I've listened to you on Brian Lehrer's Show on NPR, I was really impressed. But today, I'm kind of disappointed. You talk about building a world class subway, but treat the residents of Southeast Queens like second class citizens, but one, giving us less than 24 hours to attend this meeting, doing it on a Muslim holiday, where our south Asian communities have to choose between their religious observance and coming to this meeting, and three, having TSA style security in a community that already has a fractured relationship with law enforcement. Are you scared of people of color? So my question, right, because this meeting is a perfect example of subliminal, institutional oppression and institutional racism that communities of color continue to deal with in this city, how do you plan to build trust with Southeast Queens and people of color moving forward? And my recommendation sir, right, is that the next meeting you have better be on this side of Queens, not on the north side of Queens, right. And you need to have --

MR. BERMAN: Thirty seconds.

MR. BERROUET: -- also another town hall in Far Rockaway.

And lastly, I think you and your team need to have an internal meeting to know the difference between transactional meetings and transformative meetings. Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you for your comments, sir.

MR. BERMAN: AJ Lahiri, Cynthia Dolphin.

MR. BYFORD: I didn't answer the question because I think it was more a statement, sir, so I thanked you for your comments. What I have said, what I have said, and the reason I'm here tonight is I think, so it's my answer to one of your points, about whether I have a problem with coming to Queens. I'm here. I'm not a mirage. We did make an error in the notice. I said very candidly that I will take the hit for that, that I'll take responsibility for that. Ultimately, I'm the president of Transit, so I will take accountability and take the hit for the fact that we didn't give you enough notice. It's, we shouldn't have coincide it with the Eid holiday as you've suggested. Fair dues, it's a fair cut, I take responsibility for that, we'll do it better next time.

MR. AJ LAHIRI: President Byford, I regularly commute from Queens to Brooklyn and one proposed segment that's to be upgraded with CBDC is the Eighth Avenue line from 59th Street to Jay Street MetroTech. However, considering that some of the constraints on the A and C lines are the merges of the A and C

that take place at Hoyt and Schermerhorn Streets, and the fact that the A and C have to share tracks between Hoyt and Schermerhorn and Canal Street. So would you agree that the benefits for riders of the A and C line would be even more substantial if you extend the proposed segment by one stop, from Jay Street MetroTech to Hoyt and Schermerhorn Street and would you consider doing so?

MR. BYFORD: Okay. So it's interesting that that line effectively has come up three times now, so I definitely think there's something we need to look into there, because that's obviously feedback from the community, so I've already said that we will have people look at that. It's not the first time actually, the first event that I've been to where people have made that point, so we will again feedback via the website once we've had time to have a look at that. Thanks for the feedback.

MR. LAHIRI: Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you.

MR. LAHIRI: [unintelligible] [00:25:13].

MR. BYFORD: Yes, so we'll make sure it's advertised via the Fast Forward, because we want to make sure we get back to you on the points we haven't answered. We're not trying to be evasive, but we -- but with best within the world, even with experts, you can't predict every question. So we will take note

of the suggestions that come up, we'll properly research them, we owe you an honest answer. We'll get them up.

MR. BERMAN: Also, if Felicia Johnson, Khaleel Anderson or Cynthia Dolphin are here, you guys can approach the mics as well.

MS. CYNTHIA DOLPHIN: Good evening. My name is Cynthia Dolphin. The reason why I'm here is because I have a concern about the MetroCard. There's been times when I swipe the card and then the system says swipe again and swipe again, I lose a fare. A lot of times, there's no transit personnel to address that concern. Now, you mentioned in your presentation about the new payment system, and I'd like to know how secure is that new payment system going to be and also will that obsolete the commuter WageWork card?

MR. BYFORD: Will it what? So I didn't quite catch the last part.

MS. DOLPHIN: The WageWork commuter card.

MR. BYFORD: Sarah? Thank you.

MS. MEYER: Well, you can use your WageWorks card to pay for the new fare payment system, so that will link up and you can use your, whatever payment method you prefer to purchases fares.

MS. DOLPHIN: Okay. Thank you.

MS. MEYER: And with the new fare payment system, no longer are the repetitive swipes going to happen. We're using, right, that magnetic, very old technology that gets scratched and bent. No longer. You can now use your phone, you could buy a card from a Duane Reade similar to a gift card, or a network of retail outlets that will sell the card.

MS. FELICIA JOHNSON: I represent Community Board 14, I'm on the executive committee of Community Board 14. I happen to live in Rockaway. It's ironic that I'm here tonight. I really have a statement, not a question, because unfortunately I missed your whole presentation. Why did I miss the presentation? A, we weren't given notice, you've addressed that already, I get that. But B, it's hard to get out here, which is ironic. This is what the meeting is about. I live on a peninsula that is 11 miles long. I work on the same peninsula. It doesn't make sense that it should take me an hour and a half to get from Beach 67th Street to the beginning of Far Rockaway, that almost every day I'm late, other than the days that I take the dollar vans. So say what you want about the dollar vans and how some of them drive, but they get me to work quicker than me waiting for the A train or me waiting for the bus.

What I don't understand is why when we have the A train, you have three Leffert A trains and you have one Far Rockaway A

train --

MR. BERMAN: Thirty seconds.

MS. JOHNSON: -- when we know that Rockaway is a transportation desert. So I think that we have, the anger that you heard from the young man is because Rockaway as a whole is always left out of the plan. I know my senator was here, I know my council person was here, I know they're going to be meeting with you later, but really, we have got to do better. When Sandy hit, we had one way in and one way out. The train went out, we had nothing, the buses, we had nothing. And yet, you continue to have the increase in fares for a community that has some of the highest unemployment, we have more shelters coming.

MR. BERMAN: Please wrap it up.

MS. JOHNSON: We have a senior citizen housing development that is going up. You have to figure out how they're going to be able to transport back and forth using public transportation, and yet you still want to continue to raise fares for substandard service. So those are just statements. I hope you take all of that into consideration, but really Rockaway, your next meeting needs to be on the Rockaway Peninsula because this audience should not have been as empty --

MR. BERMAN: Please wrap it up, thank you.

Ms. JOHNSON: -- as it was tonight. Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Thank you. Just one point on the vulnerability of the Rockaway Peninsula and I went down there just the other day to have a look at it. We are doing work right now, as you'll be aware, on the peninsula to repair the damage done by Superstorm Sandy but also to make it more resilient going forward. With regard to the location of the next town hall, to which I've already committed, given the problems we had with advertising this one, I'll take a view, and I do intend to talk to elected officials, because you know, if we have it in Rockaway, someone will say will we're hiding and we're not having one back here. So we'll try to get the consensus view. But I will take the guidance of your elected officials.

MS. JOHNSON: To get from Rockaway to any place else in the city --

MR. BYFORD: So that's the reason that we're here tonight, to talk about a plan that I want and that's the reason I came here, to turn this thing around and to give you the modern transit system that you deserve.

MS. JOHNSON: thank you. And to [unintelligible] [00:29:59] fixing up of the A line, during the summer season, we had the highest --

MR. BERMAN: Thank you so much, we really have to keep moving.

MS. JOHNSON: -- [unintelligible] [00:30:05].

MR. BERMAN: Khaleel Anderson and Odane Kirby are the last people I have on the list and then c'est la vie, it's been great being here.

MR. KHALEEL ANDERSON: Good evening, Mr. Byford. My name is Khaleel Anderson, I'm a member of Community Board 14 in the Rockaways. I share the sentiment of Felicia, with the state senator, with Councilman Richards about making sure that the next town hall meeting is in the Rockaways, particularly because it takes a really long time to get to South Jamaica and you know, the opportunity, the alternatives are not available for the residents of the Rockaways, so that's the first thing I want to say.

Also, I would you to commit to the following things in improving the service in the Rockaways. I would like to see a skip stop train on the A line. The J line has skip stop at 7:30 in the morning until 9:30 in the morning as well. For the morning rush, the train skips low ridership stops and it's able to get into the city a lot quicker. I'd like to see that on the A line. I'd also like you to implement a full emergency plan for the A train. We have frequent outages on that A train. Just two weeks ago, when we had that lightening storm, there was no A train service for two hours. My brother was stranded on the way

MR. ANDERSON: Last one, we'd like you to restore H train service in the Rockaways. We used to have H train service that took you from Mott Avenue to 116th Street and stopped at all the stations in the Rockaways. Being that the Q22 was voted one of the slowest buses in Queens, we should have more options to get up and down the peninsula and the H train service would be that. Thank you.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. Thank you. [applause] We, again, we'll add that to the list of things we need to feedback to you on via the website.

MR. BERMAN: Finally, is there an Odane Kirby? That's the last one. That's all I've got on the list, so maybe -- alright. I think Andy if you just want to take it away with some closing remarks.

MR. BYFORD: Okay. So I'll keep it brief, it's getting late, people probably want to go home. What I want to say is again, apologies for the problems with the advertising of this. As I've already said, I'll take responsibility for that. But on a more positive note, I've really enjoyed tonight. I think we've had some good debate. We've had some great questions. We've had some great feedback actually, all things that we will consider. So where we weren't able to answer things immediately, we will get the experts to have a look and we'll get you some considered

answers on the website. At the end of the day, I think we're all on the same page. I think we all want better transit. That's why I'm in this game, that's why I've done this for 29 years. At the end of the day, I think we all want what this plan will deliver, which is world class transit to address the frustrations that we've come across tonight. So I would just like to ask you to bear with us while we go around the city and we lobby politicians, we lobby advocacy groups, we talk to customer groups, we build that compelling coalition that I talked about earlier.

This isn't going to be easy. It's not going to be cheap. It does require your patience while we do this, but if we all pull together and we all want the same thing and we're all prepared to put up with a bit of inconvenience while this happens, I believe that we can deliver this plan. If it takes 250 of these town halls to win that argument, I will do that. So I'd just like to thank you again tonight. I'd like to thank my colleagues [applause] as a team, and I mean the big team with you as well, if we want it enough and we lobby hard enough, this plan can be a reality in less than 4,000 days. Have a safe trip home, everyone. Thanks very much.

[Town Hall Adjourned, August 21, 2018 at 9:10 PM]

CERTIFICATE OF ACCURACY

STATE OF NEW YORK

SS:

COUNTY OF NEW YORK

I, Fei Deng, Project Manager at Geneva Worldwide, Inc.,
certify that the foregoing transcript of proceedings for the
MTA NYCT Fast Forward Town Hall / Queens / York College on
August 21, 2018 was prepared using the required transcription
equipment and is a true and accurate record of the
proceedings to the best of my abilities and belief.

This certificate is issued by Geneva Worldwide, Inc.
256 West 38TH Street, 10th Floor, New York N.Y. 10018.

Certified By

Fei Deng

Sworn to and subscribed before me

This 30th day of August 2018

Christina S. Santiago

Notary Public

Christina S. Santiago
NOTARY PUBLIC, STATE OF NEW YORK
Qualified in Suffolk County
O1SA6361307
Commission Expires 07/03/2021